Low Income Oversight Board (LIOB)

December 6th, 2017

**Draft Meeting Minutes**

**City of Fresno**

**Council Chambers**

***2600 Fresno Street***

***Fresno, CA 93721***

[www.liob.org](http://www.liob.org)

**Call - In Number 1-866-630-5989** - **Passcode 33 62 110#**

**10am-3pm**

### Meeting Called to order at 10:00am by Chairman Castañeda

***LIOB Board Members Present:***

*Chairman Robert Castañeda, Commissioner Cliff Rechtschaffen, Vice-Chairman Benito Delgado-Olson, Jeffrey Linam, Patricia Watts, Lisa Davidson, Jason Wimbley, Charlie Toledo and Ortensia Lopez*

***LIOB Members Absent:***

*Larry Gross and Jose Atilio Hernandez*

***California Public Utilities Commission (CPUC) Staff Present:***

*Kevin Troung, Syreeta Gibbs, Zaida Amaya, Ravinder Mangat and Rami Kahlon*

***In Person Participants:***

*Sheila Lee, Davi Ibarra, Serv Berelson, Luis Amezcua, Rahil Maharaj, Amanda Myers, Roberto DelReal, Mauricio Blanco, Jose Landeros, Quirino Banuelos, Luis Chavez, Allan Rago, Andy Garcia, Ron Garcia, Arleen Novotney, Vanessa Melvin-Gunn, Giovanna Casillas, Kathy Wickware, Emma Ponco, Adam Avila, Octavio Verduzco, Mark Aguirre, Martha Lucey, Mary O’Drain, Erin Brooks, Anna Solorio, Marlene Murphy, Casey McFall, Mike McCain, Anni Chung, Gabriella Sandoval, Ana Montes, Jerry Waymire, and Ed Bonham*

***Via Conference:***

*Elvira Valez, Rosie Casillas, Enrique Gallardo, Karl Stellrecht, Lola Odunlami, Gilda Araguin and Carol Edwards*

1. ***Welcome and Introductions—Chair Castañeda - Standing Item***

*Chairman Castaneda and Commissioner Rechtschaffen welcomed all present to the Low Income Oversight Board meeting and thanked the City of Fresno for hosting the LIOB meeting.*

1. ***Public Comments— Facilitated by Chair Castañeda - Informational/Standing Item***

*Mr. Berelson from Nest Labs informed the Board about Nest’s thermostats and their goal to empower the low income communities to save energy with this technology. These thermostats are available at discounted rates for low income customers. Utilities also offer energy efficiency rebates for these types of thermostats.*

*The Board is interested in a report from the IOU’s on smart thermostats and energy management technology/education for low income customers.*

1. ***Approval of the September 27th, 2017 LIOB Meeting Minutes, Facilitated by Chair Castañeda- Action Item***

*Motion: Board Member Castaneda moved and Board Member Toledo seconded a motion for approval of the minutes of September 27, 2017. Yes: Chairman Castañeda, Commissioner Rechtschaffen, Vice- Chairman Delgado-Olson, Board Members Watts, Wimbley, Toledo, Lopez, Linam and Davidson; motion passed. (No Abstentions)*

1. ***CPUC Standing Reports:***
2. LIOB Board vote to add Low Income Multifamily Housing Program as standing item

*Motion: Board Member Castaneda moved and Board Member Toledo seconded a motion to add Low Income Multifamily Housing updates as a standing item on the agenda. Yes: Chairman Castañeda, Commissioner Rechtschaffen, Vice- Chairman Delgado-Olson, Board Members Watts, Wimbley, Toledo, Lopez, Linam and Davidson; motion passed. (No Abstentions)*

1. LIOB Board vote to add CSD and IOU Coordination on Low Income Weatherization Program (LIWP) as standing item

*Motion: Board Member Castaneda moved and Board Member Toledo seconded a motion to add CSD and IOU Coordination on Low Income Weatherization Program updates as a standing item on the agenda. Yes: Chairman Castañeda, Commissioner Rechtschaffen, Vice- Chairman Delgado-Olson, Board Members Watts, Wimbley, Toledo, Lopez, Linam and Davidson; motion passed. (No Abstentions)*

1. Legislative Update - Office of Governmental Affairs

No update provided

1. [Water Utilities’ Current Issues – Kevin Truong – Update and Summary of SB 623 (Monning)](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Item%204d.%20Water%20Utilities'%20Current%20Issues%20SB632%20LIOB010617.pptx)

*Rami Kahlon, Director of Water Division, provided an update on SB 623 (Monning); this bill would establish the Safe and Affordable Drinking Water Fund in the State Treasury and would provide that the fund is continuously appropriated to the state board. The bill would require the board to administer the fund to secure access to safe drinking water for all Californians. It was also mentioned that consumers interested in getting involved in this Bill should contact their assembly person and senator. The Board will discuss and provide recommendations to the Commission through the Legislative Subcommittee.*

1. [Lifeline Telephone Program Update – Anna Jew](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Item%204.e%20California%20LifeLine%20Presentation%20LIOB120617.ppt)

*This item was tabled to the next LIOB meeting.*

*The Board requested for an update on the Lifeline/Tribal Lifeline program at the next board meeting specifically, Tribal Lifeline and the status of the contract for Lifeline marketing and outreach. There were also comments that the CPUC complaint process is complex and lengthy.*

1. [Highlights of Upcoming Activities for Low-Income Energy Programs – Energy Division](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Item%204f.%20Highlights%20%20Activity%20%20for%20Low%20Income%20Energy%20Program-LINA%20status%20Dec%206%202017Rev.pptx)

*Syreeta Gibbs, ED Staff, provided a summary report to the Board on the ESA and CARE program and proceeding status. Ms. Gibbs highlighted that the 4 IOUs filed their conforming Advice Letters and requested an additional $325M in unspent funds to implement various program changes and directives required in the Decision. Four Draft Resolutions were issued in early November 2017 addressing the Conforming Advice Letters. The draft resolutions authorize approximately $316M in unspent ESA funds and approximately $9M in additional CARE funds to implement decision directives. Remaining unspent funds not authorized via the resolutions will be used to offset future authorized funding collected in rates. Ms. Gibbs provided a summary on the 2017-2020 ESA program budgets, as well as an update on the proposed decision, issued on November 14, 2017 resolving two Petitions for Modification. The PD is currently on the agenda for vote during the December 14, 2017 Commission meeting. Ms. Gibbs also provided an update on the status of the LINA. The Board thanked Energy Division for all of their work.*

1. [Update on Multifamily Housing Working Group Activities – Elisa Galawish, Working Group Facilitator](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Item%204.g%20MultiFamily%20Housing%20Working%20Group%20Activities%20LIOB120617.pptx)

*Ms. Galawish provided and update on the MFWG. To date the MFWG has held 2 quarterly meetings as directed by D.16-11-022 and 3 Ad Hoc meetings. These meetings have all been well attended and have been utilized as a forum to vet proposals, recommendations, and solicit input from key stakeholders regarding program designs and implementation plans for common area measures. The Working Group is progressing and the IOUs are preparing to submit implementation as directed in March 2018. Questions about the MFWG can be directed to CPUC staff and the Facilitation Team.*

***5. Special Reports – Informational/Action/Discussion***

1. [Update - TEAM and CHANGES – Public Advisor’s Office](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Item%205a.%20CHANGES%20LIOB%20Presentation%20Dec%206%20FINAL.pptx)

*Mr. Ravinder Mangat from News & Outreach Office provided an update on the CHANGES program.*

*Ms. Casey McFall gave an over view on the CHANGES Program from May 1 – October 31, 2017. CBOs resolved 1,831 combined dispute resolution and needs assistance cases during the first 2 quarters of the program year, including HEAP, payment plans, payment extensions and bill adjustments, 70% of cases were related to stopping disconnection or assisting with reconnection. Ms. McFall mentioned that their funding allows the CBO to do 100 cases a year, which averages to about 8 cases per month. The funding for CHANGES is through CARE; however the CPUC will be looking at ways to fund the CHANGES program through the regular Commission budget. The Board encouraged Ms. McFall to reach out to the Board to see how the Board can assist, support or advocate for the continuation of the CHANGES program.*

*Commissioner Rechtschaffen requested for Ms. McFall to provide his office with the disconnection findings that were discussed at today’s meeting. Commissioner Rechtschaffen mentioned that the Commission is looking closely at disconnection issues and that the Bill sponsored by Senator Hueso mandates the Commission to examine disconnections and evaluate utility performance in this area. The Commission as a whole is trying to grapple with affordability issues more broadly including the rising rates of disconnections.*

*Chairman Castaneda suggested discussing disconnections through the subcommittee process. It was suggested that the subcommittee collect information on the situations in which disconnections are occurring and why they are increasing, this will better inform the policy discussion about how to improve the rate of disconnections.*

1. **Update - Disadvantaged Communities Advisory Group**

*Ms. Gibbs informed the board that the Draft Resolution is scheduled for a vote by the CPUC on Dec. 14, 2017.  The CPUC and the Energy Commission are seeking applicants to serve on the Advisory Group.  Applications are due on Dec. 22, 2017. Ms. Alice Glasner will provide an update at next LIOB meeting.*

*Chairman Castaneda mentioned that the Charter requires the Chair to appoint a member or two to serve as a liaison between the Low Income Oversight Board (LIOB) and the Environmental Justice Advisory Committee (EJAC). The Board will vote to appoint a member to serve as the LIOB liaison at the next LIOB meeting.*

1. [Expiring Board Members Terms – Commissioner Rechtschaffen](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/12-5-17%20ACR%20Inviting%20Applications%20for%20Appointment%20to%20the%20LIOB.pdf)

*Commission Rechtschaffen announced that an ACR was issued on December 5th, 2017, inviting applications for appointment to the LIOB. Applications are due January 8th, 2017 to* [Sean.Simon@cpuc.ca.gov](mailto:Sean.Simon@cpuc.ca.gov)

1. [KingsNet – Presentation by Kings County Office of Education on model for low-cost broadband](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Item%205d.%20KingsNet%20Closing%20the%20digital%20divide%20V2LIOB120617.pptx)

*Mr. Jerry Waymire, the Assistant Superintendent of the Kings County Office of Education, provided a report on*

*Kings County’s innovative approach to connectivity for low income communities. Mr. Waymire explained Kings County is a rural county with large geographical areas and sparse population and Broadband options for schools and the community are limited. The need for this type of technology is essential as schools are adopting digital curriculum and tools as part of the learning process. Students in participating schools receive the service for free, with unlimited access to the internet. School Pays $10 per month per mobile hotspot, the hotspot allows up to 6 computers to connect to the Internet. Families where a school is not yet participating pay $15 per month for low income families and $30 per month for all others. This is a very scalable solution, and due to their success many other counties are showing interest. The current customer base is 4200 students with devices provided by the schools and an additional 850 LTE home users. Academic improvement results from 14-15 to 15-16 has had an impressive increase. Unexpected community benefits also include ccommunity access, computer literacy classes for adults, E-commerce in rural communities and ability to access resources online. The Board agreed that this is a great model and that it could be the solution to many communities including the Tribal communities. The Board thanked Mr. Waymire for his presentation.*

1. [***Technical Advisory Committee Update***](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Item%206.%20Technical%20Advisory%20Committee%20LIOB120617.pptx) ***(Board Members Delgado-Olson & Wimbley) – Update and Presentation on CARE Penetration Rate Mapping***

*Vice-Chair Delgado-Olson informed the Board that the TAC has been diligently working with external stakeholders, administrators at the State and County level of Public Assistance programs, to identify ways to streamline CARE enrollment through other public assistance programs such as Cal-Works, Cal-Fresh, Medi-Cal, Free-Reduce price meal program, etc. Mr. Delgado-Olson presented a sample map and analysis for Contra Costa County that shows that there are 114,709 households enrolled in one or more of these public assistance programs that automatically qualify you for CARE. The long term hope is to integrate this with fee-reduce price meal data too, which may increase the number slightly. Since the last meeting, TAC has have met with Secretary Diana Doole’s office, her external affairs deputy secretary is interested in working with the TAC in this issue. The TAC has also talked to the State Department of Social Services and several county social services agency directors about how we would implement this concept. The plan is to continue to talk to the different parties independently and have the first TAC meeting late January or early February. Board Member Lopez mentioned that this issued was looked at some time ago and there were some issues and challenges the IOU’s experienced at that time.*

1. [**Joint Investor Owned Utilities’ Reports - Informational/ Standing Item**](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Item%207.%20%20Joint%20IOU's%20Reports%20LIOB120617%20rev.pptx)

Joint IOU’s Report of the California Alternate Rates for Energy (CARE) and Energy Savings Assistance (ESA) programs including LIOB and Aliso Canyon updates

* Collaboration with CSD on LI Multi-Family Housing
* Low Income Solar Offerings
* PG&E – HVAC background

*Mr. Mark Aguirre of SoCalGas presented on CARE and ESA program performance on behalf of the joint IOs.. The data presented were as of October 31, 2017. It was noted that in response to the* [*D.16-04-040*](http://docs.cpuc.ca.gov/PublishedDocs/Published/G000/M160/K091/160091266.PDF)*, which eliminated the go-back-rule, SoCalGas has implemented measures to prioritize and encourage more enrollment of 2020 customers and they hope to see more increases in first touches vs. go-backs. The IOU’s continue to focus on Tribal outreach and progress is being made as they continue to target Tribal communities. The Board commended the IOU’s for their improvement in their multi-family statewide participation. The IOU’s reported on the various solar programs offered by the utilities.*

*Additional Report/Information requested from the IOU’s:*

*The Board requested for the IOU’s to include: raw statistics of 100% penetration rates (including the actual number) for each county for CARE for the last three years and 2017 through the most recent month possible; raw statistics of 100% penetration rates ESA and disconnections by County and zip code.*

*Comparative analysis based on savings and costs between new homes vs. go-backs*

*On the Solar Program: Include information on the spend rate of the incentives and how much incentives are still available and the locations of where the solar projects are located.*

1. **Subcommittee Reports and Updates - Standing /Action/Discussion Item**
2. Low Income Energy Assistance Program (Board Members Castaneda, Davidson, Watts, Gross, Wimbley and Lopez) – **Update and Presentation to the Board of a working draft** [**on LIOB Guiding Principles, Vision and Mission Statement**](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Item%208a.%20LIOB%20Guiding%20Principles%20-%20Vision%20and%20Mission%20Statement.docx)

*The LIEAP met on November 14, 2017 to discuss and draft the LIOB Guiding Principles Vision and Mission statement. Board Members Watts and Davidson will provide a final draft for the Board to take a final vote at the next LIOB meeting.*

1. Water and Climate Subcommittee (Board Members Linam, Delgado-Olson, Castaneda, Toledo and Lopez) **Jeff Linam to present LIOB with** [**Water Policy and Legislative Fact Sheet**](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Item%208b.%20Fact%20Sheet%20CA%20Initiatives%20for%20LI%20Water%20users%20and%20Disadvantage%20Communities%20-%20Water%20and%20Climate%20Subcommitteev2.docx) **(10 min)**

*The water and climate subcommittee met on November 14, 2017, the focus of this meeting was on education. Board member Linam provided an overview of the water policy and legislative fact sheet. He mentioned that a report is expected from the State Water Board in February on AB 401. He also mentioned that the current rulemaking that the Commission has implemented is looking at harmonizing some of the low income program among the PUC regulated companies.*

1. Legislative Subcommittee (Board Members Hernandez, Delgado-Olson and Watts) **no update**
2. Low Income Needs Assessment (LINA) (Board Members Delgado-Olson, Hernandez, Davidson, Wimbley, Lopez and Watts) **no update**
3. **Future Meetings Dates, Location & Agenda Items - Discussion Item**

*For the 3rd quarter meeting Chairman Castaneda suggested moving the location from Burbank to the Riverside county area due to the desert climate, staff will work with the Board and the Commissioner’s office on location.*

*Meeting Adjourned at 2:50pm*

Next Meeting: TBA