

## Low Income Oversight Board Meeting

Wednesday, December 5<sup>th</sup>, 2018

150 S Palm Ave

Stockton City Hall

9:30am – 4:00pm

[www.liob.org](http://www.liob.org)

Call - In Number 1-866-630-5989 - Passcode 33 62 110#

Draft Meeting Minutes

**Meeting Called to order at 9:30am by Chairman Castañeda**

**LIOB Board Members Present:**

Chairman Robert Castañeda, Commissioner Cliff Rechtschaffen, Vice-Chairman Benito Delgado-Olson, Patricia Watts, Marlene Murphy-Roach, Jeffrey Linam, Jason Wimbley, Charlie Toledo, Lourdes Medina and Maria Stamas

**Absent:** Larry Gross

**California Public Utilities Commission (CPUC) Staff Present:**

Sarah Owens, Rian Troth, Charles Mason, Sarah Sharpe and Zaida Amaya

**In Person Participants:**

Paola Benassi-PG&E, Lori Leiva-PG&E, Mary O'Drain-PG&E, Louis Lopez-SCE, Joni Key-SCE, Holly Merrihew-SCE, Charisse Reed-SJCLHEAP, Monica Gaines-City of Stockton Recovery Center, Julia Hattan-Rising Sun, Jodi Pincus-Rising Sun, Justina Cara-Rising Sun, Mark Aguirre-SCG, Erin Brooks-SCG, Octavio Verduzco-SCG, Jose Gonzales, Proteus, Jose Landeros-Proteus, Quirino Banuelos-Proteus, Ana Montes-TURN, Fabian Perez-Fathers and Family of San Joaquin, Kathy Wickware-SDG&E, Sheila Lee-SDG&E, April Johnson-SDG&E, Sara Nordin-SDG&E, Bryce Tiernan-SDG&E, Brandi Turner-SDG&E; Carina Lane-Housing Authority; Shauna Jacob-Child Abuse Prevention Counsel; Eric Payne-Center Valley Urban Institute; Mike Bushey-SCE; Cynthia BrunoRattergy-RHA; Martha Lucey-RHA; David Price-Synergy; Jorge DeNava-CVOC; Annie Chung-Self Help for the Elderly; Tiffany Phovixay-Family Resources & Referrals;

**Via Conference:**

Nicole Holliman-SCE; John Rivera-SCE; Nilah Ahmed-PG&E Lydia Flores-American Insulation; Brittney Lee-SDG&E; Daisie Cristobal-Sanchez-SCG; Rachael Portillo-RHA; Inaudible

1. **Opening Remarks - Welcome and Introductions— Robert Castañeda, LIOB Chair and Commissioner Clifford Rechtschaffen - Standing Item (10 min)**
  - **Introduction of New Board Members -Lourdes Medina, Dolores Huerta Foundation and Marlene Murphy-Roach, PG&E**

The Board thanked the City of Stockton and Mayor Tubbs for hosting the LIOB meeting at the Stockton City Hall. The LIOB is embarking on new efforts to have broader community involvement, more public comment, more attendance from community groups and non-governmental organization to participate and bring concerning issues before the LIOB.

Commissioner Rechtschaffen announced that at the October 25<sup>th</sup>, 2018 Commission meeting, the Commission approved the appointments of Lourdes Medina, a public member position and Marlene Murphy-Roach from PG&E as the Utility Representative.

2. **Approval of the September 20th, 2018 LIOB Meeting Minutes - Action Item**

Motion to approve the September 20<sup>th</sup>, 2018 meeting minutes as corrected by Vice-Chairman Delgado-Olson, moved by Board Member Toledo, seconded by Vice-Chair Delgado-Olson. Yes: Chairman Castañeda, Commissioner Rechtschaffen, Board Members Watts, Stamas and Toledo. Abstained: Board Members Wimbley, Murphy-Roach, Linam and Medina; motion carried.

3. **Michael Tubbs, Mayor of Stockton**

• **Guaranteed Income for Low-Income Residents**

The Honorable Mayor Michael Tubbs welcomed the LIOB to the City of Stockton. Mayor Tubbs mentioned that Stockton is ground zero for some of the issues that the LIOB oversees and mentioned that 2 of the zip codes with the highest shut-off rates belong to Stockton. Mayor Tubbs spoke about Stockton's Economic Empowerment Demonstration (SEED) program, where 100 Stockton residents will receive \$500 a month for 18 months, starting in February 2019. He added that the \$500 is not a solution to all of the issues, but it will alleviate some of the burdens that affect some of residents in Stockton, especially those that are dealing with disconnection issues. Mayor Tubbs reiterated that the work of the Board is extremely important for the low-income communities in Stockton and expressed the desire to work with community leaders and this board to discuss ways and figure out how to assist residents and avoid shut-offs/disconnections with their basic utilities.

The Board made mentioned of the CARE (California Alternate Rates for Energy), the ESA (Energy Savings Assistance Program), the FERA (Family Electric Rate Assistance), the low-income weatherization program (LIWP) administered by CSD, and the low-income rate assistance (LIRA) through the water companies, are all of programs designed to assist low-income customers.

Commissioner Rechtschaffen thanked Mayor Tubbs for his visionary leadership and mentioned that the Commission will continue to work with the City of Stockton to find solutions to reduce disconnections. He also mentioned that he is the assigned Commissioner to the affordability proceeding and that the Commission will be working on developing a matrix on what constitute an affordable level of services for the citizens of California and welcomes Mayor Tubbs' input and expertise in this subject matter. Vice-Chairman Delgado-Olson offered to share the TAC's committee data with the Mayor's office, in correlation with other enrollments and subsidy programs and strategies to increase enrollment.

4. **Assemblymember Susan Talamantes Eggman – District 13**

Due to unforeseen circumstances, Assembly Member Eggman was not able to present before the LIOB meeting.

5. **Honorable Ron W. Goode, Tribal Chairman of the North Fork Mono Tribe**

Mr. Goode the Tribal Chairman for the North Fork Mono Tribe spoke before the Board. Mr. Goode provided an in-depth discussion about global warming, the water drought, as well as the benefits of well-executed, well-timed cultural burns for land and water, explaining that cultural burns can not only reduce the risk of large, out-of-control wildfires, but they can also increase the flow of water in streams and help Indigenous people meet aesthetic and spiritual obligations. The North Fork Mono Tribe has several riparian (riverside) and mountain meadow restoration projects underway, from the San Joaquin Valley floor to the higher elevations of the Sierra Nevada. Mr. Goode spoke about the challenges many of the Tribes face when it comes to basic utilities, as some of the locations of the Tribes are in extreme remote locations and he would like to see more involvement from the utilities to assist these communities. Mr. Goode volunteers his time with five collaborative and tribal forums enhancing the ecological environment, watersheds, and cultural resources of the forests, parks and tribal lands. The North Fork Mono Tribe is one of the older Tribes in CA in Eastern Madera County, and it is one of the lowest economic areas of Madera County. Their homeland covers 1.2 million acres, and they cover the counties of Mariposa, all of Eastern Madera County, portion of Northeast Fresno County and some of Indio County. It was mentioned that all low-income programs offered by the IOU's are available to the Tribal communities. Ms. Stephanie Green is the CPUC's Tribal liaison and each of the IOU's have an assigned Tribal liaison that can be contacted to assist with these services.

6. **Planning, Discussion and Suggested Locations for 2019 LIOB Meetings**

The Board discussed locations for future LIOB meetings. The Board suggested partnering up with local groups and constituents to focus on issues of local importance. There was a suggestion to work with the community college districts to reach the millennials that are not aware of these programs. The Board also heard from Mr. Eric Payne with the Central Valley Urban Institute in Fresno that has worked closely with the PG&E's SHARE program, he offered to assist with transit services to residents who may want to attend the Board meetings in the western part of Fresno. Other suggested locations were: East Bay Contra Costa County (Richmond), Alameda County, Fresno County (City of San Joaquin, Firebaugh, Tranquility, Mendota), Bakersfield (Kern County, Hanford (Kings County), Tulare County. South Bay Cities in Southern CA (Compton, Downey, Gardena, Torrance, Inglewood, Lomita, Lawndale, Hawthorne), San Diego (San Ysidro, Chula Vista, City Heights). Consideration should also be given to the 10 communities recommended by the CA Air Resources that have been identified as having the highest cumulative impacts from multiple air pollution sources in California. Board Member Wimbley mentioned that CSD is introducing a new LIWP program focused on farmworker housing. This program will increase the energy efficiency of homes owned or rented by farmworker families; reduce energy bills; provide access to solar energy; and provide some health and safety improvements to homes. Commissioner Rechtschaffen encouraged Board members to seek advance engagement opportunities within the communities where the LIOB intends to meet. It was suggested that when deciding on locations, the Board should take into consideration the time of the year, especially during harvest season and seasonal work. Board member Medina to work with staff to

assist with outreach notices to make them appealing to the public and also provide the Board with advice on how to increase public access more broadly and to take this community engagement to a much higher level.

**Chairman Castaneda reminded the Board that in order for this effort to be successful, it will require each board member to be proactive, and to personally reach out to organizations, CBO's, constituents, faith organizations and government officials to get the word out. He also mentioned that there is a robust list of CBOs' broken down by region that can be provided.**

**7. Joint Investor Owned Utilities' Reports - Informational/ Standing Items**

**a. Joint IOU's Report of the California Alternate Rates for Energy (CARE) and Energy Savings Assistance (ESA) programs including Aliso Canyon**

Ms. Mary O'Drain from PG&E provided a high level report on the CARE and ESA programs, the report reflects 2018 YTD updates. Board Member Medina mentioned that customers may feel intimidating in the re-certification process, especially if income taxes are required. Ms. O'Drain explained that the CARE program is a self-certified program and that for the verification process customers are asked to provide income eligibility, to be re-enrolled or other alternatives besides incomes taxes that a customer can provide, such as categorical eligibility. The IOU's are trying to simplify the process and welcome any ideas that the Board may have to assist with this process. Board Member Wimbley commented that as penetration rates gets closer to 90%, a focus may be needed to be place on the hard to reach communities, which requires different strategies and attention and CSD wants to make sure that they make those opportunities available to these communities. Board Member Wimbley asked for update on the CARE capitation and penetration contracts funded by CSD, to compare the correlation to the penetration rates in those areas.

Ms. Anna Montes from TURN commented that many of the calls she receives are from customers that are dropped from the CARE program due to their inability to provide proof of income taxes. She suggested changing the outreach material to reflect the different alternatives customers have when providing this information. She also mentioned issues with the high usage customers that delay in providing tax documentation, due to the lengthy process with the IRS.

Ms. Casey McFall made comments regarding the inability of the CHANGES/TEAM CBO's to assist with the CARE and FERA enrollment. The IOU's stated that there is nothing precluding the CHANGES/TEAM CBO's from assisting customers with enrollments. Staff will consult with parties involved to get clarification on the issue and if necessary, the LIEAP subcommittee will convene a meeting.

Ms. O'Drain clarified that the 2018 authorized ESA budgets includes the unspent funds authorized in the conforming advice letter resolution and the clear plans dispositions, it does not include unspent funding requested in the IOU's mid-cycle updates filing, as those have not been approved. She also clarified that the PG&E has a new data base which created some discrepancies related to payments, the 44% YTD reported for PG&E will be corrected by the end of the year.

Board Member Medina commented that trust issues within the Latino and migrant community is a huge factor. Customers may not be flexible to these free programs because of the lack of knowledge and may relate the ESA program with the PACE financing.

Ms. O'Drain also reported that on the multi-family, all IOUs have begun to implement their common area measures (CAM) initiative implementation plans.

**Information on CARE and the Concerns on the "Public Charge" Rule**

It was clarified that the CARE, ESA and FERA programs are ratepayer funded, not taxpayer funded, and this public charge rule does not apply to these programs. Fear of participation may still exist as many customers may perceive IOUs as government agencies.

**b. Recognition to PG&E for Efforts on Audit and Energy Conservation and Water Utilities on Retrofits, Devices**

Item moved under 10c.

## 8. Presentations from Community Local Groups – CBO's /Non-Profits

- Jorge De Nava, Executive Director of [Central Valley Opportunity Center](#)

Mr. De Nava provided an overview of the services provided by Central Valley Opportunity Center (CVOC). CVOC is a non-profit employment training and service provider organization, that serves farm workers and low-income populations in Merced, Madera, and Stanislaus counties.

- Jose Gonzales, - [Proteus, Inc.](#)

Mr. Jose Gonzales provided a history of Proteus, Inc., their programs, vision and values. Proteus, Inc., is a non-profit organization that upgrades community employment and training program. Proteus currently administers over 40 different programs throughout the Fresno, Kings, Tulare, Kern and parts of LA county. The organization also owns and operates a foster family agency in Fresno and administers the William M. Maguy School of Education.

The Board asked if the shortages for the workforce are being addressed?

Mr. Quirino Banuelos commented that there is a need to reach the rural population, and that the demand requires a different model than just traditional community colleges. These are populations that have basic skills deficiencies, English barriers, and basis transportation issues, specially in areas such as Firebaugh, Mendota and Allensworth, and added that the more you localized and invest, the more efficient they can be, in providing those services in combination with the energy services that they offer in those areas.

- Tiffany Phovixay, [Family Resource & Referral Center](#)

Ms. Phovixay provided an overview of the 2-1-1 San Joaquin Call Center. 2-1-1 service is a free, accessible, three-digit telephone number that gives everyone in covered areas access to needed community services. The 2-1-1 service covers 38 California counties. It is available 24 hours a day, seven days a week, allowing residents to access information about health and human services, emergency care, crisis intervention, and disaster preparedness, response, and recovery when they need it most. Ms. Phovixay reported that in 2017, 2-1-1 received over 11, 000 calls from residents and from January 2018 – September 2018, 2-1-1 has already referred 1,100 customers to utilities and low cost energy programs. [SB 1212](#) was signed into law in 2016 with the emphasis to facilitate access to disaster preparedness, response, and recovery information, and referral services, especially in hard-to-serve rural areas, through a universally available telephone service. The 2-1-1 is funded through the San Joaquin County, Kaiser Permanente and First 5 in San Joaquin. Ms. Turner mentioned that the IOU's work closely with 2-1-1 and their collaboration has been very successful.

- Jodi Pincus and Justina Caras, [Rising Sun](#)

Rising Sun is offers workforce development work as well as local employment with youth in energy efficiency and water conservation work. Last year, they provided energy education to 900 homes. One of the obstacles they see in applications for these programs is not only the language barrier, but the jargon used in these applications, which can be confusing to customers. They expressed concern about the wages that are paid, these salaries are not family sustained wages. Rising Sun has moved away from training people for ESA jobs and moved into union jobs, because those are higher paying and benefited jobs. They also mentioned that as we move to carbon free economy, some thought needs to be given to the ESA program offerings. Consideration needs to be given to electrification and holistic services to repair homes and provide a strong and healthy infrastructure, in order to make long term changes, to make positive impacts in the lives of these communities. Commissioner Rechtschaffen commented that the Commission has started and adaption proceeding and one the elements of this, is looking at the impacts, particularly in vulnerable communities.

## 9. Special Reports/Updates – Informational Items

- a. [CETF Presentation on SDG&E's and SoCalGas' Broadband Pilot Project](#) – Lloyd Levine

Mr. Lloyd Levine presented a high level overview of SDG&E - 211 Pilot San Diego Pilot. CETF has drafted letters for the Board to consider, both to the IOU's and the CPUC on behalf of the Board expressing support and encourages the CPUC to figure out a way to help fund these programs. CETF believes that there are a number of funds including ESA funds that might be eligible to fund these outreach efforts to bridge the communication gap.

The Board applauded the efforts and thanked CETF for the presentation. The Board noted that these public assistance programs as it related to internet are not all universal. It was also mentioned that some rural counties in CA have built their own LTE systems that have deliveries speed that work better than private market providers and cost as low as \$6-7 per household.

The Board will review the letters to determine the best approach to this request, and if necessary, the LIEAP subcommittee will convene a meeting to make recommendations.

b. **TEAM AND CHANGES Report – Ravinder Mangat – Public Advisor’s Office**

Mr. Ravi Mangat provided a brief on the CHANGES program. Mr. Mangat highlighted that the current contract will be ending in Spring of 2019. Ms. McFall from Milestone Consulting provided an overview of the CHANGES services provided to costumers as well as issues and barriers that CBO’s have encountered that have been proven difficult to resolve. CHANGE continues to receive calls regarding water issues, however, they are not authorized to provided services related to water.

10. **Subcommittee Reports and Updates**

a. **Low Income Energy Assistance Program (Board Members Castaneda, Stamas, Watts, Wimbley, Stamas and Murphy-Rocha) 11/13/18**

**Action – Approve and Adopt LIOB’s Recommendations for the ESA Cycle Post-2020**

The Board discussed at length the recommendations by the LIEAP subcommittee. The Board voted and adopted the Low Income Oversight Board ESA Post-2020 white paper with all of the recommendations discussed herein. Chairman Castaneda will work with Board Members Stamas and Board Member Murphy-Roach to incorporate the recommendations discussed. A final/approve document will be circulated to the full board.

Update: [The approved LIOB recommendations for the ESA Cycle Post-2020](#) can be found here.

Motion to approve the LIOB’s ESA Post-2020 White Paper recommendation as discussed by the Board. as corrected by Vice-Chairman Delgado-Olson, moved by Board Member Toledo, seconded by Vice-Chair Delgado-Olson. Yes: Chairman Castañeda, Commissioner Rechtschaffen, Board Members Watts, Stamas and Toledo. Abstained: Board Members Wimbley, Murphy-Roach, Linam and Medina; motion carried.

Board Member Murphy-Roach reminded the Board that there is the multi-family CAM pilot that is on their way, which is designed to bring learnings that we can use to make more informed decisions.

b. **Legislative Subcommittee (Board Members Delgado-Olson, Stamas and Watts)-No Update**

c. **Water and Climate Change Subcommittee (Board Members Linam, Delgado-Olson, Castaneda and Toledo)**

**Low Income Water Affordability Issues – Board Member Jeff Linam**

● **PG&E Lessons Learned from Pilot** (PG&E and RHA)

Ms. O’Drain provided a brief on PG&E’s ESA energy water conservation plan, this was a collaboration with water utilities and other stakeholders to develop a strategic leveraging plan to integrate and deliver existing water agency conservation programs offering with ESA program offerings.

The LIOB presented PG&E with an outstanding achievement award for their extraordinary work and great success of this pilot.



d. **Low Income Needs Assessment (LINA) (Board Members Delgado-Olson, Castaneda and Murphy-Rocha)- No Update**

11. **CPUC Standing Reports**

a. **Energy Division Updates**

● **Disconnection Proceeding Update**

Informational Item Only

12. **Updates on the Technical Advisory Committee and the Disadvantaged Communities Advisory Committee (Standing Items)**

• **Technical Advisory Committee Update (Board Members Delgado-Olson & Wimbley) – Updates on Progress**

Vice-Chair Delgado-Olson reported that the TAC is still on track to present at the next LIOB meeting. They are encountering challenges with data collection from the State, but the IOU's have been very cooperative. In the meantime, they've been collecting it from a large number of counties with the assistance of CSD and Human Services Secretary's Office. A formal committee meeting is being planned, and there will be solicitation input from state holders.

• **Disadvantaged Communities Advisory Committee Update (Board Member Stamas)**

Board Member Stamas reported that the DACAG has adopted the [Equity Framework](#). DACAG discussed [AB 617](#) which relates to community mission reduction program and puts emphasis on disadvantaged communities and also looking at how to target the CPUC's programs to those communities and facilitate those efforts. Lastly, DACAG discussed the CA Climate Change assessment report, adaptation and the increase cooling needs that they are anticipating in the coming years.

13. **Future Agenda Items/Closing**

The Board thanked Mayor Tubbs and the City of Stockton for hosting the LIOB meeting and to the community local group that were present at today's meeting. Meeting adjourned at 4:30pm

DRAFT