Low Income Oversight Board (LIOB)

September 27, 2017

**Draft Meeting Minutes**

CITY OF NATIONAL CITY

COUNCIL CHAMBERS

CIVIC CENTER

1243 NATIONAL CITY BOULEVARD

NATIONAL CITY, CA

10:00am – 3:00pm

[www.liob.org](http://www.liob.org)

**Call - In Number 1-866-630-5989** - **Passcode 33 62 110#**

### Meeting Called to order at 10:00am by Chairman Castañeda

***LIOB Board Members Present:***

*Chairman Robert Castañeda, Vice-Chairman Benito Delgado-Olson, , Larry Gross, Jeffrey Linam, Patricia Watts, Lisa Davidson, Jason Wimbley, Charlie Toledo, Jose Atilio Hernandez and Ortensia Lopez*

***LIOB Members Absent:***

*Commissioner Cliff Rechtschaffen*

***California Public Utilities Commission (CPUC) Staff Present:***

*Sean Simon, Kevin Troung, Syreeta Gibbs and Zaida Amaya*

***Public Presenters:***

*Henry DeJesus, Rebecca Baez-Huntsman, Giovanna Casillas, Mayda Bandy, Mary O’Drain, Erin Brooks, Daisie Cristobal Sanchez, Octavio Verduzco, Dave Contrell, Mark Aguirre, Sheila Lee, Maria Stamas, Andew Dugawson, Kathy Weickware, Matt Lewis, Kim Rodriguez, Mauricio Blanco, Roberto Del-Real, Brad Bond, Brandi Turner, Mark Alfaro, Karin Burns, Davi Ibarra, Anthony Abeyta, Rosette Solidum, John Fasana, Laura Welty, Richard Villasenor, Angel Garcia, Allen Fernandez-Smith, Lloyd Levine, Susan Walters, Jessica Parker, and DeeDee Tscherch*

***Via Conference:***

*Due to technical issues, the names of the participants were not captured.*

1. ***Welcome and Introductions—Chair Castañeda - Standing Item***

*Chairman Castaneda welcomed all present to the Low Income Oversight Board meeting and thanked National City for hosting the LIOB meeting. The Board welcomed Ms. Lisa Davidson of SDG&E as the new LIOB utility representative. The LIOB also acknowledged the service and work of Mr. Roberto Del-Real, who recently retired from SCE, and wished him a farewell.*

1. ***Public Comments— Facilitated by Chair Castañeda - Informational/Standing Item***

*Mr. Collin Rice from the RAHD Group, which specializes in acquisition of rehab affordable housing projects, provided comments on the affordable housing industry, and offered ideas on transitional opportunities and existing opportunities. Mr. Rice in his statements indicated that there is a “preferred window of opportunity” available to best serve low-income multifamily housing decision-makers and that is at the time of acquisition.*

*Ms. Maria Stamas from the Natural Resources Defense Council provided comments on the allocation of the unspent funds for the multi-family program design. Ms. Stamas also referenced the San Diego Village Island, a Veteran’s housing project, which has had a savings in utility bills of $26,000 and achieved 44% in average savings for the affordable housing sector per property. Ms. Anna Solorio from Community Housing Opportunities Corporation (CHOC), commented that multi-family has been a very complex and controversial issue and that the ESA low income funds were created for a very specific purpose, such as workforce development and direct benefits for low income customers. Ms. Solorio further stated using these funds and taking them out of this context and setting them aside to serving property owners instead of low income customers, creates a fundamental shift in the intent of the Legislation to serve low income people. The LIOB agreed to include multi-family issues during their subcommittee process and as a function of the IOU reporting.*

1. ***Approval of the June 8th, 2017 LIOB Meeting Minutes, Facilitated by Chair Castañeda- Action Item***

*Chairman Castaneda recommended that Board Members take notes of the issues that are important to them, as the minutes will reflect summarized action item rather than verbatim discussions. Vice-Chair Delgado-Olson noted a correction on pg. 3 item 7h, sentence to read*: *Legislation receiving majority of vote from the LIOB will be posted on the LIOB website and sent to the Commission.*

*Motion: Board Member Gross moved and Board Member Toledo seconded a motion for approval of the minutes of June 8, 2017. Yes: Chairman Castañeda, Vice- Chairman Delgado-Olson, Board Members Gross, Watts, Wimbley, Toledo, Hernandez, Lopez, Linam and Davidson; motion passed. (No Abstentions)*

1. ***CPUC Standing Reports:***
2. [Highlights of Upcoming Activities for Low-Income Energy Programs – Energy Division](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Item%204.a%20Highlights%20%20Activity%20%20for%20Low%20Income%20Energy%20Program-LINA%20status%20LIOB92717.pptx)

*Syreeta Gibbs, ED Staff, provided a summary report to the Board on ongoing activities in the Commission’s CARE and ESA proceeding. Ms. Gibbs’ report included the Ad hoc MF Working Group, workshops, prehearing conferences, and the status of the Low Income Needs Assessment (LINA) study. Ms. Gibbs mentioned that bidders have to register with PEPMA (Proposal Evaluation & Proposal Management Application) to bid on the work. Petition for Modification (PFM) Decision & conforming advice letter resolutions is anticipated for the 4th quarter of 2017.*

1. [Water Utilities’ Current Issues](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Item%204b.%20Water%20Utilities'%20Current%20Issues.pptx)

*Kevin Truong, Water Staff, provided a summary report to the Board on the 2016 low-income total customers, the low-income Order Instituting a Rulemaking (OIR), and update on AB 401, the cost of capital proceeding and an update on water Legislation.*

***5. Special Reports – Informational/Action/Discussion***

1. Update on the California Fair Political Practices Commission (FPPC) - Legal Division

*Laura Gasser, Legal Division Staff, provided an update on the applicability of Gov. Code Section 1090 to the Board. FPPC declined to give an informal opinion and upon internal discussion, Legal Division decided not to move forward as they felt comfortable with the research they gathered. While Gov. Code Section 1090 does apply to advisory boards, further research revealed that the Attorney General in the past determined that if an advisory committee is statutorily required to have members who have financial interest in the subject matter, Gov. Code Section 1090 is not applicable to the LIOB.*

1. Presentation of the LIOB Achievement Award: SDG&E

*The Board presented The LIOB Achievement Award to San Diego Gas and Electric Company and Synergy for going above and beyond on the work they did on the Sorrento Tower (low income Multi Family housing for seniors and people w/ disabilities) project.*

1. Statement of Guiding Principles for the LIOB – Chairman Castaneda

*This item will be discuss as part of the LIOB’s subcommittee process*

1. DAC Advisory Group
2. [PUC Tribal Consultation Policy](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Item%205.e%20PUC%20Tribal%20Consultation%20Policy%20LIOB92717.pdf)

*Sean Simon, Chief of Staff to Commissioner Clifford Rechtschaffen, provided an update on the DAC (Disadvantaged Communities Advisory Group that was established under SB 350, which directs the CPUC and the Energy Commission to establish and advisory group to provide advice on programs proposed to achieve clean energy and pollution reduction. In comments on the proposed structure, several commenters recommended that the DAC included one member from the LIOB and one member from the Air Resource Board, details on how the LIOB and the DAC will interact are still being examined. Next steps include soliciting applicants for selection by the PUC and the CEC. A proposed charter will be issued in a draft resolution; recommendations for memberships should be submitted to Alice Glasner from the CPUC and Alana Matthews from the CEC. Chairman Castaneda will follow up with staff regarding existing coordination efforts and will keep the board informed. Ms. Syreeta Gibbs is to update the Chairman as to the progress of forming the SB 350 DCAG and the possible collaboration with the LIOB. Mr. Simon also reported on the proposed Tribal consultation policy. The Executive Order directs state executive agencies and departments to “encourage communication and consultation with California Indian Tribes.” It further directs state agencies and departments “to permit elected officials and other representatives of tribal governments to provide meaningful input into the development of legislation, regulations, rules, and policies on matters that may affect tribal communities. The Commission will be initiating a public process and the draft PUC Tribal Consultation policy will be issued for comment. The CPUC and CEC will continue meetings around the state to meet with Tribal governments on policy issues and obtain feedback. Stephanie Green is the Commission’s liaison in the Business and Community Outreach office and it was requested by Chairman Castaneda that Ms. Green make a presentation at the next LIOB meeting in Fresno.*

1. [***California Emerging Technology Fund (CETF) Presentation on Pilot Program Partnership – Informational Item***](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Item%206.%20CETF%20Pilot%20Project%20Presentation%20LIOB092717.pptx)

*Mr. Lloyd Levine from CETF provided an update on the 2017 digital divide; and a report on SDG&E’s and SoCalGas’ 211 pilots. Mr. Levine presented the percentage of Californian’s with broadband at home as well as results from a survey conducted in Fresno, which showed that of 309 respondents, 23% of households have no internet access, and all are eligible for discounted service, but only 33% have low cost internet. For a period of 4 months, SDG&E callers to 211 San Diego who are seeking utility payment assistance (water, gas, or electricity service) or information about discounted products from SDG&E, will be asked about their home high-speed Internet (broadband) access and connectivity status. Customers without home broadband service who are interested in subscribing, and are eligible for a reduced-cost broadband offer will be referred to one of the affordable subscriptions offered by AT&T or Cox (consumer’s choice). SoCalGas will add a paragraph to its existing CARE recertification letter, which is sent to its CARE customers on a rolling basis. The paragraph will inform customers that they may be eligible for low-income broadband programs and direct them to call 211 LA for more information.  This letter will be sent to 10,000 customers over three month period. The Board asked Mr. Levine to keep the Board informed on any Legislation that maybe of interest to the Board.*

1. **Future of Low-Income Needs Assessment– Vice-Chair Delgado-Olson- *Discussion/Action Item***
2. **Structure and Process**

*Vice-Chair Delgado-Olson proposed to create a Low-Income Needs Assessment temporary subcommittee to enable the LIOB to fully and openly discuss its engagement in future LINA studies. This would be an opportunity to bring in experts that could lend their expertise in various aspects of the LINA and provide input to Energy Division and produce a document that would outline the goals the Board would like to see come out of the LINA.*

***Motion by Vice-Chair Delgado-Olson for the Board to create******a special LINA committee, for purposes of outlining future LINA study activity, seconded by Board Member Lopez – The Subcommittee will consist of Vice-Chairman Delgado-Olson, Board Member Hernandez, Board Member Davidson, Board Member Watts, Board Member Wimbley and Board Member Lopez.*** *Yes: Chairman Castaneda, Vice- Chairman Delgado-Olson, Board Members Gross, Watts, Wimbley, Toledo, Hernandez, Linam, Lopez and Davidson; motion passed. (No Abstentions)*

1. [**Joint Investor Owned Utilities’ Reports - Informational/ Standing Item**](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Item%208.%20Joint%20IOU%20Report%20ESA-CARE%20LIOB92717_IOUs%20FINAL%20Rev.pptx)
2. *Joint IOU’s Report of the California Alternate Rates for Energy (CARE) and Energy Savings Assistance (ESA) programs*

*1. How ESA program unspent funds are committed in the low income Decision (D.16-11-022);*

1. *2. Update on status of “go backs” versus “first treatments” since the changes in applicable rules were ordered in D.16-11-022.New Reporting formats for IOUs* 
   * *Zip-code/census tract based data to report penetration rates*
   * *Geospatial mapping*
   * *Future addition of shutoff/disconnection data/reports*

*Giovanna Casillas presented a high level report of the joint IOU’s report on CARE and ESA programs. The data were as of July 31, 2017. A correction was noted on the 2017 multi-family update common area, it should read “anticipated implementation by approximately Q4 2017 instead of Q3” Federally recognized Tribes for PG&E is 51, for SCE 13, for SoCalGas 20 and for SDG&E 19. SCE’s ESA intensified efforts for Aliso Canyon reporting a total of 93,197 homes treated within the designated area through July 2017; similarly, SoCalGas reported a total of 63,590 homes treated through July 2017. The IOU’s also reported on their ESA unspent funds and clarified that there are no CARE unspent funds. Chairman Castaneda raised the issue of HVAC and the importance of health, comfort and safety, specifically in the PG&E territory with extreme heat. PG&E explained that they don’t have many HVAC measures approved by the Decision, and commented PG&E offers cooling centers funded out of their CARE budget. Chairman requested additional background on barriers and information regarding which climate zones PG&E currently installs HVAC measures and PG&E agreed to follow up regarding this topic. Chairman Castaneda reminded PG&E that the expansion of HVAC in Climate Zone 13 was specifically ordered by the Commission. Castaneda also reminded PG&E that both Southern California Edison (SCE) and Pacific Gas & Electric share Climate Zone 13 as part of their respective service territories and to date only SCE has responded with that expansion of that cooling measure respective to the decision. The IOUs also provided a zip-code/census tract based data report on penetration rates as well as the geospatial map. The Board thanked the IOU’s for putting together this detailed information. The Chairman also requested that progress reports be made by the IOUs as to their progress with updates on the CSD/IOU collaboration to leverage their respective low-income energy programs.*

*Chairman Castaneda thanked Vice-Chair Delgado-Olson for taking the lead on the BCP process also thanked Commissioner Rechtschaffen for the support he has given to the LIOB, for his leadership and his support for these programs and for representing the best interest to the low-income communities.*

1. **Subcommittee Reports and Updates - Standing /Action/Discussion Item**

* ***Discuss and Vote on Consolidation of the Current Subcommittees and Creation of New Subcommittees and Potential Changes in Assignments***

1. *Marketing & Outreach (Board Members Toledo, Gross, Watts & Delgado-Olson)* ***no report***
2. *ESAP & CARE Implementation (Board Members Castaneda, Wimbley, Watts & Lopez)* ***no report***
3. *Workforce Education and Training (Board Members Hernandez & Castaneda)* ***no report***
4. Water Industry (Board Members Linam, Lopez and Castaneda) **no report**
5. Emerging Issues/Climate Change (Board Members Toledo, Delgado-Olson & Hernandez) **no report**
6. AB 327 Subcommittee (Board Members Hernandez, Lopez & Wimbley) **no report**
7. [Legislative Subcommittee](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Item%209.g%20Recommendations%20on%20Bills%20from%20the%20LIOB%20Legislative%20Subcommittee%20Mtg081117.docx) (Board Members Hernandez, Delgado-Olson, & Wimbley)

*Board Member Hernandez moved and Board Member Lopez seconded the motion to approve the Legislative Subcommittee minutes approving the positions on the recommended Bills. Yes: Chairman Castañeda, Vice- Chairman Delgado-Olson, Board Members Gross, Watts, Toledo, Hernandez, Lopez, and Linam and; motion passed. (Abstentions from Board Members Davidson and Wimbley)*

* + [***Report on Recommendations on Bills from the Legislative Subcommittee to PUC; Action Item – Board Adoption of the Recommendations***](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/CPUC%20LIOB%20Leg%20%20Update%20LIOB92717.pdf)

*Hazel Miranda from OGA provided an update on Bills that passed Legislation. The Board was informed that it can engage the Commission at any time to address any Bills that are of interest to Board members.*

1. Technical Advisory Committee (Board Members Delgado-Olson & Wimbley) ***Update***
   * Membership (external and inclusive of LIOB)
   * Meeting Schedule

*Board Member Delgado-Olson moved and Board Member Toledo seconded a motion to approve the consolidation and creation of 4 subcommittees. Yes: Chairman Castañeda, Vice- Chairman Delgado-Olson, Board Members Gross, Watts, Wimbley, Toledo, Hernandez, Lopez, Linam and Davidson; motion passed. (No Abstentions)*

*New Subcommittees Created:*

* *Low Income Energy Assistance Program Subcommittee (Chairman Castaneda, Board Members Davidson, Watts, Gross, Wimbley and Lopez)*
* *Water and Climate Change Subcommittee (Chairman Castaneda, Board Members Linam, Toledo, Lopez and Delgado-Olson)*
* *Legislative Subcommittee (Board Members Hernandez, Delgado-Olson and Watts)*
* *Low Income Needs Assessment (LINA) Subcommittee (Board Members Hernandez, Delgado-Olson, Davidson, Wimbley, Lopez and Watts)*

1. **Future Meetings Dates, Location & Agenda Items - Discussion Item**

*The following items will be discussed as part of the Low Income Energy Assistance Program Subcommittee:*

1. *Multi-Family Housing issue to be discussed in connection with IOU reporting*
2. *CSD Collaboration with the IOU’s*
3. *AB 327 – implementation*

*Additional Items to be included in the agenda:*

1. *Update on Lifeline*
2. *IOU’s to report on the disposition of low income solar offerings*
3. *CHANGES Team to provide an update*
4. *Water Update from Board Member Linam – joint programs with the energy and water utilities.*

*Meeting Adjourned at 2:50pm*

Next Meeting: Wednesday, December 6th, 2017 - City of Fresno - Council Chambers -[2600 Fresno Street  
Fresno, CA 93721](https://goo.gl/maps/V9avyyrcDys)