**Low Income Oversight Board Meeting**

*Thursday, September 20th, 2018*

*150 S Palm Ave*

*Rialto, CA*

*10am – 3:30pm*

[www.liob.org](http://www.liob.org)

**Call - In Number 1-866-630-5989** - **Passcode 33 62 110#**

**Draft Meeting Minutes**

### Meeting Called to order at 10:00am by Chairman Castañeda

***LIOB Board Members Present:***

*Chairman Robert Castañeda, Commissioner Cliff Rechtschaffen, Vice-Chairman Benito Delgado-Olson, Patricia Watts, Lisa Davidson, Larry Gross, Charlie Toledo, and Maria Stamas*

***Absent:*** *Jeffrey Linam and Jason Wimbley*

***California Public Utilities Commission (CPUC) Staff Present:***

*Asia Powell, Hope Christman, Kevin Troung, Rian Troth, Drisha Dalton and Zaida Amaya*

***In Person Participants:***

*Daisie Cristobal-Sanchez-SCG, James Ozenne-SCG, Davi Ibarra-SCE, Louis Lopez-SCE, Nicole Holliman-SCE, Sheila Lee- SDG&E, Mary O’Drain-PG&E, Roger Snow-Proteus, Martha Lucey-RHA, Sara Nordin-SDG&E, Mike Bushey-SCE, Holly Merrihew-SCE, Richard Villasenor-TELACU, Jose Landeros-Proteus, Joni Key-SCE, Roberto DelReal-Maroma Energy, Mauricio Blanc- JHC, Inc., Mark Aguirre-SCG, Arleen Novotney-ACCES, Q. Banuelos-Proteus, Brandi Turner-SDG&E, Kathy Andry-CSD, Karen Sturgen-SCG, Octavio Verduzco-SCG, Rosie Casillas-SCE, Elvira Valdez-SCG, Rahil Mahara-Supply Bank.org, Leonella Baudino-SCG, Naila Amhed-PG&E, Kathy Wickware-SDG&E, and Louis Lopez-SCE*

***Via Conference:***

*John Peterson-Athens Research, Chris Moore-CPUC, Derek Olijar-Liberty Utilities, Melissa Smith, Andres Ramirez- DACAG, Unaudible*

1. ***Welcome and Introductions— Robert Castañeda, LIOB Chair and Commissioner Clifford Rechtschaffen Standing Item/Informational Item***

*Commissioner Rechtschaffen reported that at the July 12th, 2018 Commission meeting, the Commission approved the re-appointments of Board Members Robert Castaneda and Charlie Toledo. The LIOB has a current public position opening, a formal solicitation will be published asking for nominations. The 2018 Tribal Energy Summit will be held on November 26th – 28th, 2018 at the Pechanga Band of Luiseño Indians in Temecula. The Disadvantaged Communities Advisory Board (DACAG) will be meeting on September 28th and October 30th, 2018. The DACAG is also seeking a new member.*

*Board Member Lisa Davidson announced that her term as the LIOB’s IOU representative for SDG&E has expired. PG&E has selected Ms. Marlene Murphy-Rocha as the new IOU LIOB representative, her appointment will be confirmed by the Commission in October.*

1. ***Public Comments- Informational/Standing item***

*No public comments were offered*

1. [***Approval of the June 8th, 2018 LIOB Meeting Minutes***](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Item%203.%20FinalDraft%20Meeting%20Minutes%20of%20the%20LIOB%20060818.docx) ***- Action Item***

*Motion to approve the June 8th, 2018 meeting minutes, moved by Board Member Gross seconded by Board Member Toledo. Yes: Chairman Castañeda, Commissioner Rechtschaffen, Board Members Watts, Gross, Stamas, Toledo, and Davidson; motion carried.*

1. [***Report on the Engagement of Community Local Groups Effort***](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Item%204.%20LIOB%20Engagement%209.20.18.FinalRev.pdf) ***– LIOB CBO Engagement Project Team - Informational/Action Item- Authorize Implementation of Recommendations***

* Survey Results
* Recommendations
* Roles and Responsibilities
* Communication Tools
* Discussion

*The CBO engagement project team provided a detailed presentation on its recent efforts to assist the LIOB on how to improve, strengthen relationships and increase active participation from community-based and non-profits organizations to complement the LIOB’s mission, vision and guiding principles. The team conducted a survey to targeted organizations, as well as the full LIOB. The team provided details on ways to operationalize this effort. Strong emphasis was placed on the importance of the board member’s personal involvement when inviting these organizations to the LIOB meetings. The team will put together a “tool kit/template” to assist the Board in their outreach efforts. Strategic thinking and careful coordination will be given to the 2019 meeting locations. The Board will explore holding meetings at community facilities, and possibly holding meetings outside the 9am-5pm schedule. It was noted that for this particular effort, contractors were not targeted, as they are already connected to the program. Ms. Arleen Novotney from ACCES commented that the meetings need to be more relevant to these organizations in order to raise interest. The CPUC will be hosting a* [*workshop to discuss the accessibility of CPUC proceedings*](http://www.cpuc.ca.gov/calEvent.aspx?id=6442459255) *and enhancing public participation on November 7th, 2018 in Fresno.*

*The Board thanked the team for a great presentation and for all of their work.*

1. ***Subcommittee Reports and Updates - Standing /Action/Discussion Item***

* ***Action Item – Assignments and or Reassignments of Members to Subcommittees***

*Motion: The Board moved and approved the following: 1)the assignment of Board Member Stamas to the Legislative Subcommittee, 2) the assignment of Chairman Castaneda to the Low Income Needs Assessment Subcommittee (LINA), and 3)and to transfer over the current assignments held by Board Member Lisa Davidson (LINA and LIEAP subcommittees) to Marlene Murphy-Rocha, PG&E’s new IOU representative. Yes: Chairman Castañeda, Commissioner Rechtschaffen, Board Members Watts, Gross, Stamas, Toledo, Delgado-Olson and Davidson; motion carried.*

1. Legislative Subcommittee (Board Members Delgado-Olson and Watts) – No Update

*OGA will provide a summary of Bills signed at the December meeting. Legislature convenes in early 2019.*

1. Joint Meeting of the Low Income Energy Assistance and the Low Income Needs Assessment (LINA)Program (Board Members Delgado-Olson, Castaneda, Watts, Gross, Wimbley, Stamas and Davidson)

*The Low Income Energy Assistance Programs Subcommittee and the Low Income Needs Assessment (LINA) met on August 1, 2018. During the meeting they discussed the process of the LINA study and the desire for the LIOB to be engaged in the process for the 2022 LINA study. There was an update on the TAC meeting from Board Member Delgado-Olson. The IOU’s provided an update on their mid-cycle advice letter filings and an update on the CBO engagement progress.*

1. Water and Climate Subcommittee (Board Members Linam, Delgado-Olson, Castaneda and Toledo*)* ***update (8-23-18)***
   * Low-Income Water Affordability Issue

*This item was tabled to the December 5th, 2018 LIOB meeting*

*Board Member Toledo commented that the effects of climate change in California is more severe than projected, especially in relationship to water and that this is a critical survival issue for everyone. It was mentioned that the*

[*Fourth Climate Change Assessment*](http://resources.ca.gov/climate/fourth/) *was recently released, this plan articulates near-term climate change research needs to ensure that the state stays on track to meet its climate goals.*

*Board Member Stamas reported that the Disadvantaged Communities Advisory Group (DCAG) is still in the early stages of defining their scope and priorities, but they are defining disadvantaged communities fairly broadly. DCAG has identified 5 priorities: Health & Safety, Access & Education, Financial Benefits of Policies; Economic Development and Workforce Development and Consumer Protection. She noted that there will be some overlap with some of the work of the LIOB.*

1. CPUC Standing Reports and Legislative Subcommittee Recommendations: (30 min) – ***Discussion/Action Items***
2. Legislative Subcommittee Update and Recommendations (Board Members Delgado-Olson and Watts) – **No Update**

* Legislative Update - Office of Governmental Affairs – ***Action Item - Recommend PUC Support and Inform Legislature of the Recommendations – No Update***

1. [Water Utilities’ Current Issues](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Item%206b.%20Water%20Utilities'%20Current%20Issues.pptx) – Kevin Truong

*Mr. Truong provided and update on the current water issues, school lead testing, Commission OIRs and new legislation.*

*AB 746 requires all community water systems serving a school built before 2010 to test for lead, by July 1, 2019, all CPUC regulated water utilities will have completed lead testing.*

1. Lifeline Telephone Program Update – Tribal Lifeline Program – Anna Jew – ***Informational***
2. [Energy Division Updates – Energy Division](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Item%206d.%20Highlights%20%20Activity%20%20for%20Low%20Income%20Energy%20Program-LINA%20and%20MF.pptx) - ***Informational/***

***Action Item- Support Timeline for LINA***

* ESA Post-2020 Guidance Document
* LINA Timeline
  + Multi-Family Working Group Update

*Mr. Rian Troth provided an update on the recent and upcoming activities for energy programs. Mid-Cycle updates advice letters were submitted on July 16, 2018. The Commission’s guidance decision is targeted for 4th quarter 2018 or early 2019 in preparation for the IOU budget application filings which are due June 1, 2019. The Commission’s decision will be addressing the budget applications. The initial planning phase for the 2022 LINA will begin once the 2019 assessment is finalized. Energy Division will coordinate with the Board and IOUs to initiate this effort and see it through to completion. Public workshops will be planned in coordination with the LIOB LINA Subcommittee.*

*Vice-Chair Delgado-Olson commented that for the next LINA cycle, the Board will like to have a more inclusive and involved role to advice the Commission in the LINA process.*

*Motion: The Board moved and approved to build a process for the LINA subcommittee to have an active role in the facilitation and process of the subsequent LINA public workshops. Yes: Chairman Castañeda, Commissioner Rechtschaffen, Board Members Watts, Gross, Stamas, Toledo, Delgado-Olson and Davidson; motion carried.*

*Ms. Caroline Chen provided and update on the ESA Multifamily common area measure initiative activity & key milestones. Ms. Chen mentioned that the Multi-Family Working Group continues to have their quarterly meetings, as well as MFWG Ad Hoc meetings. Meetings are open to all participants, documents and related information on the MFWG can be found at:* [*https://pda.energydataweb.com/*](https://pda.energydataweb.com/)

1. LIOB’s Recommendations for the ESA Post-2020 Guidance Document – ***Discussion/Action Item – Authorized Comments to CPUC***

*The Board discussed their vision and principles on what they’d like to see in the guidance document of the ESA post 2020. Board Member Stamas mentioned that there are a lot of new factors to take into consideration. She proposed to delegate this task the Low Income Energy Assistance Program Subcommittee to develop a page vision on the principles for the next cycle and provide them to the Energy Division to be incorporated in the guidance document. Commissioner Rechtschaffen*

*mentioned that there is a broad mandate to not just save energy and money, but also to improve the health and safety of the low-income rate payers. Commissioner Rechtschaffen would like to see the use of the CARE ESA funds to provide cooling measures, specifically air conditioning, in areas where low-income residents are extremely impacted by climate change, to the extent that the CPUC has discretion without statutory change, if not, should the CPUC make recommendations for legislative change? Commissioner Rechtschaffen also mentioned that beyond 2020, careful consideration needs to be given to what areas or households should be promoted for go-backs, specially in areas where they are heavily impacted by pollution, or low constraints areas.*

1. Special Reports/Updates – *Informational Items (30 min)*
2. Discussion of Early [Draft Environmental & Social Justice Strategy and Roadmap](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Item%208a.%20Draft%20Environmental%20and%20Socal%20Justice%20Strategy%20Action%20Plan.pdf) Governing the CPUC’s Activities in the Energy, Water, Transportation and Telecommunications *sector (20 minutes)* ***Discussion/Action Item – Authorize Comments to CPUC***

*Commissioner Rechtschaffen provided an overview of the CPUC’s vision for Environmental and Social Justice Communities and provided an overview of the Commission’s nine overarching goals. Board Member Gross stressed the importance of incorporating the economic aspect to this and added that due to the need of the usage of AC’s in the low-income communities, there has been an increase in their utility bills, which threatens their ability to pay their rent. Board Member Davidson commented that the definition of environmental social justice community and disadvantaged communities (DAC’s) need to be crystal clear, and which communities will need to be targeted in order to achieve the goals. She also mentioned that the focus on clean transportation is very important in their territory, as there are very few power plants located in DAC’s. Lastly, she commented on the framework of cost effectiveness and to take into account some of the other environmental attributes. She emphasized the importance of being accurate and transparent on the cost and the benefits to rate payers.*

*Commissioner Rechtschaffen encouraged the Board to provide comments on any of the all areas, individually or as a Board. Comments can be submitted to ED staff, directly to the Commissioner’s office or to anyone listed on the Disadvantaged Communities Advisory Group.*

1. Coordination Report of CSD and IOU on Low Income Weatherization Program (LIWP) Jason Wimbley, CSD

*Ms. Kathy Andry from CSD provided an update on the coordination between CSD and the IOU’s. Ms. Andry reported that CSD continues discussions with PG&E’s Legal Department regarding the funding agreement and the finalization of an affidavit form, as well as the procedural forms that will be use by CSD’s administrators and the owners of the affordable housing units that will be receiving the ESA measures. Once the template agreement has been approved, all of the IOU’s will be using the same form. Ms. Landry discussed the income qualification and mentioned that in order to serve the entire property at least 80% of these units must qualified under the 200% federal poverty level. CSD will be using process call “rent roll” concept, in which all of the members of the household have to certify their income. To provide energy education, CSD will use the State Energy Education Resource Guide to both the clients as well as property owners. CSD has also developed a reporting prototype that will capture measure level details. Levering efforts will begin in November or December. The Board thanked Ms. Andry for the update.*

1. [Technical Advisory Committee Update](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Item%209.%20Project%20Scope%20-TAC%20LIOB092018.pptx) (Board Members Delgado-Olson & Wimbley) *–-Informational Item (20min)*
   * Comparison of CARE enrollment data and public assistance enrollment data
   * Disconnection data
   * Data Sharing
   * Early findings
   * Scope of Services

*Vice-Chairman Delgado-Olson provided an update on the current activity the technical advisory committee. Vice-Chairman Delgado-Olson emphasized that the goal is not only to create tools or pathways to increase enrollment and penetration in these programs, but also to prevent disconnections and shut-offs. Having different types of reporting formats and utilizing geospatial mapping in creative ways will help the Board better advice the Commission, IOU’s, and other state holders on how to invest, administer, and improve these programs in the future. Vice-Chairman Delgado-Olson also mentioned that if this report shows gaps in coverage, it could benefit in the scoping process for the 2022 LINA study. The TAC is planning to have a full scope completed before the next LIOB meeting and will invite their partners, IOU’s, advocacy organizations and other state holders to attend, and have this project completed by the first LIOB meeting of 2019.*

*Commissioner Rechtschaffen commented that there are many potential benefits from this project and that it could potentially assist in the disconnection efforts for the CPUC. Board Member Stamas mentioned that the Department of Energy and NREL Lab recently compiled an energy burden by a census track, and that there might be an the opportunity to look at how energy burdens is correlated with bills and how it contributes to disconnections.*

*The Board applauded Vice-Chairman Delgado-Olson and Board Member Wimbley for all of their work and efforts on this project. Vice-Chairman Delgado-Olson thanked Rahil Maharaj for all his work on this project.*

1. [Joint Investor Owned Utilities’ Reports](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Item%2010a.%20Joint%20IOU's%20Report%20of%20the%20CARE%20and%20ESA%20ProgramsRev.pptx) – *Standing/ Informational/Action/Discussion/* *Item (45 min)*
2. Joint IOU’s Report of the California Alternate Rates for Energy (CARE), Energy Savings Assistance (ESA), ME&O and Aliso Canyon updates

*Chairman Castaneda encouraged Board members to review the monthly reports filed by the IOU’s. These reports contain very valuable information on the performance of the programs. Staff will work with IT to put these reports on the LIOB website for easy access. Alison LaBonte Supervisor of the Residential Programs and Portfolio Approval Section in the Energy Division clarified that the utilities were required to file advice letters detailing plans and budgets for the expenditure of unspent funds for each effort or new measure directed in the Decision. Mr. Mark Aguirre clarified that the clear plan was approved for SoCalGas and that unspent funds were shifted into the current budget to help meet the 2020 goals.*

1. [Report on Workforce Education and Training (WE&T)](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Item%2010b.%20ESA%20Education%20N%20Training.pptx)

*Mr. Rodger Bradfield from SCE provided an overview of the report on WE&T, mentioning that D.16-11-022, ordered the IOU’s to conduct a workshop, to present their existing and planned Energy Education modules for the Energy Savings Assistance (ESA) Program. On March 8th, 2018 the joint IOUs convened the Energy Education Public Meeting; as a result, the State Wide Training Working Group was formed. The IOU’s synergized a Statewide Energy Education Guide and they are also working on synergizing their training materials across the State. Ms. Brandi Turner provided a high level report on the Energy Efficiency side and provided a summary of the different programs. Ms. Turner clarified that everything listed on the document is funded through the Energy Efficiency Program and does not include any of the low-income programs. The Energy* [*Efficiency Rolling Portfolio Business Plan*](http://cleantechsandiego.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/SDGE-EE-Business-Plan.pdf) *follows the Commission’s guidance on how the IOU’s will achieve the Commission’s statewide energy efficiency goals and strategies. Commissioner Rechtschaffen relayed concerns expressed from the Community College Representatives and the State Workforce Development Board concerning the limitation of integrating this career path into their college curriculum and their apprenticeship programs. Ms. Turner mentioned that over the last few years they have been working with the Chandler’s office and that there is a lot of opportunities to improve in these areas and that they are working on making it better. Chairman Castaneda would like to see the tracking activity with the disadvantaged communities through the ESA program and additional partnerships with local training institutions located within DAC’s, as well as leverage opportunities with local organizations. Mr. Bradfield mentioned that they are looking at ways to make the training accessible throughout the state, including computer based training. Edison has changed their entire training model, all of their respective contractors self-train and take their final test/exam in Rosemead or Visalia.*

b.1 [ESA Penetration for 2018 and Remaining Eligible Population](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Item%2010b.1%20ESA%20Penetration%20for%202018%20and%20Remaining%20Eligible%20PopulationRev.pptx)

*The IOU’s presented their household treatment goals for 2018-2020. A document on the regulatory background on the required annual of the number of customers eligible for the* [*CARE and ESA Programs*](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Item%2010b.1a%20Estimating%20Elig%20for%20ESA%20and%20CARE%20Programs%20by%20Athens%20LIOB092018Final.ppt) *that is produced by Athens Research was provided. The IOU’s offered to conclude a meeting with Athens Research to clarify any information provided.*

1. Future Meetings Dates, Location & Agenda Items - *Discussion Item*

*The Board will have a constructive and thorough discussion on 2019 meeting dates and locations at the next meeting. Suggestions from other the IOU’s, CBO’s, constituents and other entities are welcome.*

|  |
| --- |
| **2018** |
| Wednesday, December 5th, 2018  Stockton City Hall  Council Chamber  425 N. El Dorado Street – 2nd Floor  Stockton, CA |

1. Next Steps/Adjourned:

*The LIOB thanked the City of Rialto for hosting the LIOB meeting. Meeting Adjourned at 4:20pm*