**Low Income Oversight Board Meeting (LIOB)**

**Wednesday, July 20th, 2016**

**State Personnel Board**

**Auditorium**

**Sacramento, CA**

**Call - In Number 1-866-642-1440 - Passcode 7516937#**

[**www.liob.org**](http://www.liob.org)

**Draft Meeting Minutes**

**Meeting Called to order at 10:08am by Chairman Castañeda**

***LIOB Board Members Present:***

*Chairman Robert Castañeda, Vice-Chairman Benito Delgado-Olson, Larry Gross, Patricia Watts, Commissioner Catherine J.K. Sandoval, Jeff Linam, Dan Rendler, , Ortensia Lopez, Jason Wimbley and Charlie Toledo*

***LIOB Members Absent:***

*Jose Atilio Hernandez*

***California Public Utilities Commission (CPUC) Staff Present:***

*Syreeta Gibbs, Tory Francisco, Hazlyn Fortune, Anna Jew, Viet Truong, John Forsythe, Jonathan Choi, Harsharan Kaeley and Marna Anning*

*Jamie Ormond, Michael Colvin*

***Public Present:***

*Susan Sudaat, Lauren Perkins, Roberto DelReal, Regina Lugani, Sheila Lee, Joy Yamagata, Yvette Vasquez, Giovanna Casillas, Nathan Aronsen, Rich Villasenor, Lauri Walker, Vanessa R. MelvinGunn, Ron Garcia, Dave Clark, Allan Rago, Mary O’Drain, Dennis Lipnisky, Vanessa Garcia, Samantha Gibson, Mark Aguirre, Bill Allen, Alex Dudrov, Tom Burns, Steve Heim, Stephanie Borba Morris and James Hodges*

***Via Conference:***

*Ted Humbrey, Carmen Rudshagen, inaudible*

1. **Welcome and Introductions— Robert Castañeda, LIOB Chair and Commissioner Catherine J.K. Sandoval -*Standing Item***

*Chairman Castañeda and Commissioner Sandoval welcomed all present to the Low Income Oversight Board Meeting in Sacramento and thanked the State Personnel Board for hosting the LIOB meeting.*

*Chairman Castañeda thanked Board Member Dan Rendler for his service as the utility representative for the LIOB and commended him and his staff for all of the work they’ve done.*

**2. Public Comments— Facilitated by Robert Castañeda, LIOB Chair - *Informational/Standing item***

*The Board heard public comments from Mr. David Duong, owner and operator of Atlas Systems Incorporated, Mr. Anthony Gilbert a former ESA manager with Atlas, Ms. Stephanie Borba Morris of TrueTeam of CA and Melissa Melvin-Gunn from American Insulation. They commented on the difficulties the contractors are facing, and many contractor companies have ceased operations after years as productive participants and more are on the verge of leaving because there are not enough eligible customers to enroll. They added that jobs and families are affected by this and that if the go back rule does not change, there will be no program. It was also commented that outreach to customers has been very difficult as many low income customers no longer have landlines, which makes it difficult to outreach to customers; contractors are paid on actual enrollment and fulfillment of services.*

**3. Approval of the February 23, 2016 LIOB Meeting Minutes, Facilitated by Robert Castañeda, LIOB Chair Action Item**

*Motion to approve the February 23rd, 2016 minute, with correction to include Board Members Toledo and Lopez from the voting actions; moved by Board Member Lopez, seconded by Board Member Toledo. (Yes: Chairman Castañeda, Vice Chairman Delgado-Olson, Board Members Linam, Watts, Toledo, Lopez, Wimbley and Rendler; motion passed) (Abstentions: Gross)*

**4. Announcement of the re-appointments to the LIOB - Commissioner Catherine J.K. Sandoval Informational Item**

* Board Member Robert Castaneda
* Board Member Jose Atilio Hernandez

*Commissioner Sandoval announced that at the June 23rd, 2016 Commission meeting the Commission approved the re-appointments of Board members Robert Castaneda and Jose Hernandez*

**5. LIOB Discussion Items - Discussion/Action Items**

1. Formal Structure for IOU Reporting
2. Low Income Multi Family Housing – Eligibility Guidelines
3. CARE Outreach Pilot (Board Member Delgado-Olson)
4. CSD GHG Program (Board Member Wimbley)
5. Chairman Castaneda’s Letter re: Justification for Resources to the LIOB

*Chairman Castañeda will coordinate a subcommittee meeting and invite the IOUs to discuss a formal and more effective way for the IOUs to report to the Board. Based on the public comments from today’s meeting, the Board will schedule a joint subcommittee meeting between the ESAP and CARE Implementation and the Marketing and Outreach subcommittees.* [*http://www.liob.org/doc7202016/Item%205e.%20Chairman%20Castaneda's%20Letter%20re%20Justification%20for%20Resources%20to%20the%20LIOB7-20-16.pdf*](http://www.liob.org/doc7202016/Item%205e.%20Chairman%20Castaneda's%20Letter%20re%20Justification%20for%20Resources%20to%20the%20LIOB7-20-16.pdf)

*Vice Chairman Delgado-Olson reported that he has been working with PG&E to find ways to enhance the outreach for the CARE program by coupling it with different social services and social welfare programs, such as the school meal programs, CalWORKs, CAL Fresh, Medical,etc. that already screen people as eligible. A pilot is being developed, a more substantive update will be provided at a later time.*

*Board Member Wimbley reported that CSD received Climate investment funds to stablish the low income weatherization program (LIWP), which provides weatherization and renewable energy services to low income residential housing located in designated disadvantaged communities’ areas. With the first appropriation received in 2014-2015, was used to launch a program that stablished 3 primary subcomponents: single family weatherization program; single family solar program and a large multi-family energy efficiency and renewable program. These three programs are active and underway; CSD is starting to see the progress and reporting of these projects. The goal of these dollars is to promote greenhouse gas reductions and extend the important co-benefits to these disadvantaged communities. With the second appropriation received in 2015-2016, CSD is looking to introducing some significate reforms to how they administer the program. On June 2, 2016, CSD held a meeting that provided general overview of proposed modifications to the existing LIWP program in preparation for drafting Program Guidelines and Request for Proposal (RFP). Participants had an opportunity to comment and offer additional ideas and suggestions to CSD. Board Member Wimbley commented that the interest shown by the ESA contractors to continue serving the low income communities and keeping these programs is overwhelming, and we should make every effort to conserve and stop the bleeding.*

*Chairman Castañeda commented that at some point he will convene a subcommittee meeting with ED and the IOUs to better define the low income multi-family eligibility.*

*On the subject of justification, Chairman Castañeda commented that this board has the authority to look at the Legislature in a very targeted and concise matter. The Board will be looking into acquiring more staff resources, including the creation of a technical advisory committee, and reaching out to other critical state agencies that work in concert with many of the working agendas that the Board is addressing. The Board is working diligently to pursue the enablement of this board to fulfill its mission in a more productive manner. The Board feels that there are a lot of issues; one of the critical issues is the direct conduit in communication with the full Commission, which is one of the Board’s mandates. Per legal opinion, the minutes of the board cannot be entered into a proceeding until the minutes are memorialized, and since the Board only meets 3-4 times a year, the window of opportunity to provide comments many times is closed.*

*Vice Chairman Delgado-Olson concurred and added that one of the things that they found as they read the statute is for the Board to assist with the LINA, which is very difficult to do without the presence of ED staff. There are some small adjustments that can solve a lot of the problems that the Board is encountering, for example many boards, including State Boards can memorialized their minutes by taking action without meeting through unanimous consent via email. In addition the Board is able to convene a technical advisory committee that consists of all state holders.*

*Board Member Gross and Toledo thanked the Chairman and Vice Chair for bringing these issues forward.*

*Chairman Castañeda welcomed executive Director Michael Lizarraga from La Cooperativa Campesina de California and Chris Paige, Director, California Human Development to the LIOB meeting. Mr. Paige provided comments on the difficulties they faced in the last year; they have been a long term, long time contractor in the RHA/PG&E program, and were very hopeful about the potential reconfiguration of the program and worked very hard with a number of bidders, including RHA, however, they found as part of this process was that the cost of doing business was higher than the current reimbursement rates for the program. They had a lot difficulty maintaining enough program flow or client flow for the program to be viable, out of about 150 contacts, they would get 1 enrollment in the program and when you have this kind of front-end headwind, the efficiency of the program declines, because you don’t have the volume that allows you to do smart scheduling and all of the other things. In June they decided to pull back and no longer be a contractor in the program but added that they believe in the program, in energy efficiency and certainly believe in getting energy efficiency to low income communities, particularly the farmer workers communities. They carried the loss and could not sustain the program from a financial stand point. They solute the work and all of the contractors in RHA, they are currently on the sidelines, but would like to be part of the discussion moving forward.*

**6. Energy Efficiency Council (EEC) – Ana Solorio – Overall Impacts to the ESA Program FY 2015-1016 Due to Program Production Slowing**

*Ms. Ana Solorio provided a presentation title ESA: a program in crisis. The ESA Program has a Go Back Rule that is antiquated and causing serious damage to the program and the low income communities. EEC is asking for the LIOB to recognize the immediate need to deliver energy savings to low income customers and save jobs in the communities by recommending to the Commission that they issue an emergency order to implement the same go back rule across all of California as it has in the Aliso Canyon territory in Decision 16-04-040.*

*Bridge Funding issued in D. 16-06-018 did NOT stop the decline in production, loss in jobs or provide for employee cost of living increases as it did not address the much needed policy changes or the increased cost of the program.*

*EEC acknowledges that the go back rule is an issue under consideration in the current proceeding (A. 14-11-007). The decision in this matter is delayed currently by more than 18 months. In anticipation of a decision, which may or may not amend the current go back permanently, immediate relief to continue to fulfill ESA’s mission is needed. The ESA program is a viable energy resource for California that generates actual measured energy and water savings in our low-income communities. ESA is built on a core infrastructure funded by ratepayer investment and developed to serve low-income customers in need of water and energy saving measures.  California is a State in need of jobs, plagued by record drought and stressed by an overworked power grid. As it stands, the ESA program cannot fulfill its mission.*

*Commissioner Sandoval commented that the Commission and staff are committed to getting a PD and APD decision within the next few weeks.*

*Mark Aguirre from SoCalGas commented that as part of the Aliso Canyon ruling, the focus is on energy savings and to imposed guidelines and structure for the program to ensure and maximize energy savings from the treatments. SoCalGas has implemented guidelines for homes treated between 2002-2008, there are no restrictions; for homes treated between 2009-2012, these homes can only be treated if certain high energy savings measures are feasible, from 2013 to present , these homes can be treated but only with SoCalGas’ direction.*

*Commissioner Sandoval asked for SoCalGas to file these guidelines with the CPUC’s Energy Division in order to track Aliso Canyon’s state of emergency.*

*Roberto DelReal commented that SCE does not have restrictions on the go-back-rule.*

*Ms. Solorio’s presentation can be viewed and downloaded at:* [*http://www.liob.org/doc7202016/Item%206.%20Energy%20Efficiency%20Council%20(EEC)%20RevLIOB72016.pptx*](http://www.liob.org/doc7202016/Item%206.%20Energy%20Efficiency%20Council%20(EEC)%20RevLIOB72016.pptx)

**7. Pacific Gas & Electric (PG&E) and Richard Heath and Associates (RHA) – CSD and PG&E Geographic Coordination Pilot - Informational Item.**

*Ms. Jeanne Clinton, the Governor’s Special Advisor for Energy Efficiency, introduced this item before the Board. She explained that a few years ago there was a request from the Brown administration to get the state agencies to work together on low income efficiency services and to come together to see if there were opportunities to maximize the value of these different funding streams and program deliver channels. The objective obviously is to get the most bang for your buck out of these funds in California. The conversation moved on to embrace the utilities on how to move forward with the coordination. Four pilots were identified to test the waters on opportunities, one of which is the Geographic Coordination Pilot.*

*Ms. Mary O’Drain explained tha D. 12-08-044 ordered the IOU’s to: Focus leveraging efforts with CSD in refining the data sharing activities with CSD’s LIHEAP/WAP programs, and to devise an effective leveraging plan, which at a minimum, shall include: (OP 25)*

*Entering into agreement with CSD to develop a comprehensive statewide database system or bi-directional data sharing exchange that will enable the identification of households served under the LIHEAP/WAP program; and the design and implementation of a partnership effort that will effectively combine the resources and benefits of the LIHEAP/WAP programs with those of the Energy Savings Assistance Program.*

*In D. 08-11-031, the CPUC stated that leveraging efforts must be measureable and quantifiable based on Dollars saved; Energy savings/benefits to eligible households and Program enrollment increases and/or customers served.*

*Mr. Nathan Aronson from RHA provided the Board with highlights of the lessons learned for this pilot.*

*Pilot demonstrated that through leveraging; more low-income customers can qualify for the ESA Program; customers can receive more energy efficiency measures resulting in greater energy savings; leveraging does create additional administrative burden, but opportunities exist to minimize this burden through training and technology.*

CSD/PG&E Weatherization Programs Geographic Coordination Pilot presentation can be viewed and downloaded at: [*http://www.liob.org/doc7202016/Item%207.%20CSD-PGE%20Geographic%20Coordination%20Leveraging%20Pilot\_FinalLIOB72016.pptx*](http://www.liob.org/doc7202016/Item%207.%20CSD-PGE%20Geographic%20Coordination%20Leveraging%20Pilot_FinalLIOB72016.pptx)

**8. Water Utilities’ Current Issues – Viet (Kevin) Truong, Utilities Engineer, Division of Water and Audits Update/Informational/Standing Item**

*Mr. Truong provided an update on the water utilities’ current issues. Mr. Truong’s report included a drought update, the drought actions and the low-income discounts.*

[*http://www.liob.org/doc7202016/Item%208.%20%20Water%20Utilities'%20Current%20Issues%20LIOB72016.pptx*](http://www.liob.org/doc7202016/Item%208.%20%20Water%20Utilities'%20Current%20Issues%20LIOB72016.pptx)

**9. Sunne McPeak, California Emerging Technology Fund - Follow Up Report: Outreach to Low-Income Households and Collaboration with Energy Utilities as a Green Strategy - Informational Item**

*Ms. McPeak provided an update energy utility collaboration, as previously reported the California Emerging Technology Fund’s (CETF) mission is to mobilize leadership statewide to close the digital divide by accelerating the deployment and adoption of broadband to unserved and underserved communities.*

*Ms. McPeak shared with the Board the preview of the 2016 annual survey, its progress and remaining challenges. Ms. McPeak spoke about the importance of CBO’s partnerships, and unlike before, there are more affordable broadband offers, however, CBO’s can assist customers select an affordable offer, become digitally literate, and secure an appropriate computing device. Unfortunately, CETF does not have the resources to continue paying the CBO’s and CETF is asking for the energy utilities to think about partnering with others and help support the CBO’s. Ms. McPeak reported on SMUD’s partnership with the* [*California Foundation for Independent Living Centers*](https://www.google.com/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&source=web&cd=1&sqi=2&ved=0ahUKEwiMsPO7-qDPAhUD0GMKHeXRB2QQFggdMAA&url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.cfilc.org%2F&usg=AFQjCNFPKy3f21t73mOhRig2cMytZKTFTA&bvm=bv.133387755,d.cGc) *(CFILC), and SCE’s pilot. CETF is in discussion with SDG&E and have started the conversation with LADWP and PG&E as well. Ms. McPeak reiterated the importance of the Low Income Oversight Board’s voice and leadership. The utilities need encouragement, focus, and reinforcement. CETF provided a draft letter for the Board’s consideration. Chairman Castañeda will discuss with staff and the Board on how to proceed with the draft letter. Commissioner Sandoval will work with CETF to arranged and coordinate a possible workshop.*

*Ms. McPeak’s presentation can be viewed and downloaded at:* <http://www.liob.org/doc7202016/Item%209.%20California%20Emerging%20Technology%20Fund%20LIOB72016.pptx>

**10. Lifeline Telephone Program Update – Anna Jew, CPUC -Consumer Programs –Communications Division - Informational/Standing Item**

1. Lifeline Proceeding Update
2. Update on Lifeline Direct Application Project
3. Tribal Lifeline Update

*Ms. Jew provided an update on the LifeLine proceeding, direct application project and an update on the Tribal Lifeline update. Ms. Jew reported that since the last meeting, they’ve set calls with the carriers to learn about their trouble outreach strategies, as well as educating each other on ways to increase Tribal participation. Aside from the carriers on the call, they also included the third party administrator Xerox as well as Board Member Toledo. On July 5th, 2016 Frontier sent 600+ letters with applications to CA LifeLine subscribers who are residing on tribal lands; they hired a consultant in Native American Culture to effectively communicate to tribal communities, they also met in person with tribal leaders to understand their needs and trained their call center representatives in the enhanced Lifeline application process. Ms. Jew thanked Board Member Toledo for participating in the calls and for the guidance provided. Ms. Jew’s presentation can be viewed and downloaded at:*

<http://www.liob.org/doc7202016/Item%2010.%20California%20LifeLine%20Presentation%20LIOB%20July%2020%202016%20in%20Sac.ppt>

**11. LIOB Website Status - Raghav Yangala – Senior Project Manager/Consultant – Informational Item**

*Mr. Yangala provided a report on the revamping of the new LIOB website, using the latest and greatest technology. He provided an overview of the main challenges with the old site, primarily dealing with obsolete technology. The new website will be built with SharePoint and will use the CPUC premises for maintenance and backup, CPUC IT Team will provide ongoing maintenance and backup. Mr. Yangala hopes for the site to Go-Live in the month of September. Vice Chairman Delgado-Olson has been the single point of contact for the LIOB and asked for final input by August 19th, 2016. Chairman Castaneda mentioned the importance of including hyperlinks. Mr. Yangala mentioned that there is flexibility to add and configure the look and feel of the website. The Board thanked Mr. Yangala for his work and requested another presentation at a future meeting. Vice Chairman Delgado-Olson will work with Mr. Yangala on this project and asked the Board to provide additional input.*

**12. CARE Rate Restructuring Pre-Working Group Presentation (R.1206013) Informational Item**

*Mr. Allen Fernandez Smith from PG&E provided a summary on the email ruling from ALJ McKinney regarding the CARE Restructuring next steps. The ruling directed the parties to hold a pre-working group meeting to discuss next steps, including: (1) Identify studies that would be useful and feasible for evaluating possible CARE discount structures; (2) Identify long‐term steps and schedule for consideration of CARE Restructuring; (3) Propose schedule for engagement of other stakeholders, including possible presentation at Low Income Oversight Board (LIOB) on July 19, 2016 (Sacramento) or a later LIOB meeting; and (4) Identify other Commission proceedings that the CARE restructuring should coordinate with or take into consideration. PG&E and TURN was to coordinate with the other parties and Energy Division to convene the pre-working group meeting. The Joint Statement of the parties participating in the CARE Restructuring Pre-*

*Working Group were to be served and filed no later than May 2, 2016. Pursuant to the April 1, 2016*, [email ruling of the Administrative Law Judge (ALJ)](http://docs.cpuc.ca.gov/PublishedDocs/Efile/G000/M159/K712/159712402.PDF) *on consideration of recommendations for restructuring the California Alternative Rates for Energy (CARE) program in this proceeding, Pacific Gas and Electric Company (PG&E), on behalf of the pre-working group participating parties, filed a statement on status of CARE Restructuring Pre-Working Group Discussions as required by the ALJ Ruling. The pre-working group parties include Center for Accessible Technology, Consumer Federation of California, Office of Ratepayer Advocates, PG&E, San Diego Gas & Electric Company, Southern California Edison Company, The Utility Reform Network and Utility Consumers Action Network, with facilitation by the Energy Division. Mr. Fernandez-Smith* provided a brief on the joint statement filed on June 6, 2016. The statement can be viewed and downloaded at:

<http://www.liob.org/doc7202016/Item%2012.%20CARE%20Status%20Report%20dated%2006-06-16%20LIOB72016.pdf>

**13. Highlights of Upcoming Activities for Low-Income Energy Programs – Energy Division Staff - Standing Item**

1. Update: Low Income Needs Assessment
2. Update: SB 350 Implementation - Development of the Definition of Disadvantaged Communities

*Ms. Gibbs provided a brief update on the Needs Assessment, the research plan was finalized in February, 2016; the data collection is ongoing till the end in summer 2016; a draft report is due in early October 2016 with a public workshop in mid/late October 2016 and a final report in December 15, 2016.*

*Vice Chairman Delgado-Olson mentioned that the last telephone survey for LINA was only done in Spanish and English, and inquired if the recent survey was conducted in other languages beside Spanish and English. Ms. Gibbs will discuss with the consultant and will report back to Vice Chairman Delgado-Olson.*

<http://www.liob.org/doc7202016/Item%2013.%20LIOB%20LINA%20and%20ED%20Status%20Update%2007202016_.pptx>

**14. Investor Owned Utilities Reports – Utility Representatives - Standing /Discussion Item**

* + - 1. CARE Enrollment Penetration and Expenditures
      2. ESA Homes Treated and Program Expenditures
      3. Highlights of 2015 Program Accomplishments

SoCalGas, SCE, SDG&E and PG&E provided their CARE Enrollment Penetration and Expenditures data and their ESA Homes Treated and Program Expenditures. The IOU’s also provided highlights of their Joint Utilities annual report public meeting held on June 1, 2016

<http://www.liob.org/doc7202016/Item%2014.%20PGE%20CARE%20ESA%20Information_%20LIOB_072016.ppt>

<http://www.liob.org/doc7202016/Item%2014c.%20PGE%20Highlights%20of%202015%20Program%20Accomplishments%20LIOB72016.pptx>

<http://www.liob.org/doc7202016/Item%2014.%20SCE%20CARE%20ESA%20Information_%20LIOB_072016.ppt>

<http://www.liob.org/doc7202016/Item%2014c.%20SCE%20Highlights%20of%202015%20Program%20Accomplishments%20LIOB72016.pptx>

<http://www.liob.org/doc7202016/Item%2014.%20SDGE%20CARE%20ESA%20Information_%20LIOB_072016.ppt>

<http://www.liob.org/doc7202016/Item%2014c.%20SDGE%20Highlights%20of%202015%20Program%20Accomplishments%20LIOB72016.pptx>

<http://www.liob.org/doc7202016/Item%2014.%20SoCalGas%20CARE%20ESA%20Information_LIOB_72016.pdf>

<http://www.liob.org/doc7202016/Item%2014c.%20SoCalGas%20Highlights%20of%202015%20Program%20Accomplishments%20LIOB72016.pdf>

**15. Subcommittee Reports and Updates – Facilitated by Robert Castañeda, LIOB Chair - *Standing /Action/Discussion Item***

1. **Marketing & Outreach (Board Members Toledo, Gross, Watts, Delgado-Olson & Rendler)**

*The Marketing & Outreach Subcommittee did not meet.*

1. **ESAP and CARE Implementation (Board Members Castañeda, Wimbley, Watts, Lopez & Rendler)**

*The ESAP and CARE Implementation subcommittee did not meet.*

1. **Workforce Education and Training (Board Members Hernandez & Castañeda)**

*The Workforce Education and Training subcommittee did not meet.*

1. **Water Industry (Board Members Linam, Lopez and Castañeda)**

*The Water Industry did not meet.*

1. **Emerging Issues/Climate Change (Board Members Toledo & Delgado-Olson)**
2. **AB 327 Subcommittee (Board Members Hernandez, Lopez, & Wimbley)**

The AB 327 Subcommittee did not meet.

**16. Future Meetings Dates & Agenda Items for Future Meeting - Discussion Item**

*The Board will schedule a joint subcommittee meeting between the ESAP and CARE Implementation and the Marketing and Outreach subcommittees. The Board will work with staff on noticing the meeting.*

*Commissioner Sandoval encouraged the Board to attend the Eureka meeting on September 22, 2016 and the tour her office will be coordinating.*

*Meeting adjourned at 4:45pm*

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Thursday, September 22nd, 2016**  Eureka City Hall  Council Chambers  531 “K” Street  Eureka, CA 95501 | **November – Date/Location TBD**  Long Beach, CA |