**Low Income Oversight Board Meeting**

California Public Utilities Commission

Auditorium

505 Van Ness Avenue

San Francisco, CA 94102

March 8th, 2018

**San Francisco**

**10am-4:00pm**

[www.liob.org](http://www.liob.org)

**Call - In Number 1-866-630-5989** - **Passcode 33 62 110#**

Archived video webcast available at: <http://www.adminmonitor.com/ca/cpuc/>

### Meeting Called to order at 10:15am by Chairman Castañeda

***LIOB Board Members Present:***

*Chairman Robert Castañeda, Commissioner Cliff Rechtschaffen, Vice-Chairman Benito Delgado-Olson, Jeffrey Linam, Patricia Watts, Lisa Davidson, Jason Wimbley, Charlie Toledo Jose Atilio Hernandez and Maria Stamas*

***LIOB Members Absent:***

*Larry Gross*

***California Public Utilities Commission (CPUC) Staff Present:***

*Sean Simon, Kevin Troung, Syreeta Gibbs,Stephanie Green , Harold Williams, Alison LaBonte, Sarah Lerhaput, Ravinder Mangat Rami Kahlon, Fe Lazaro, Patti Cassaro and Zaida Amaya*

***In Person Participants:***

*Chris McRoberts, Octavio Verduzco, Kathy Wickware, Mayda Bandy, Ron Garcia, Allan Rago, Emma Ponco, Serj Berelson, Brandi Turner, Eric Brooks, Rosette Solidum, Mary O’Drain, Davi Ibarra, Marlene Murphy-Roach, Kerin Burns, Daisie Sanchez, Arleen Novotney, Casey McFall, Eric Yamashita, Ortensia Lopez, Landis Marttica, Anni Chung, Edward Hsu, Susan Herrschaft, Rahil Maharaj, Mark Aguirre, Maritessa Bravo, Johanna Valentine, Srinidhi Sampath Kumar, Kimberly Lukasiak, Mauro Dresti*

***Via Conference:***

*Dennis Guido, Carol Edwards, Roberto DelReal, Melinda Martinez, inaudible*

1. ***Welcome and Introductions— Robert Castañeda, LIOB Chair and Commissioner Clifford Rechtschaffen***

*Chairman Castaneda and Commissioner Rechtschaffen welcomed all present to the Low Income Oversight Board meeting in San Francisco.*

1. ***Election of the LIOB Chair and LIOB Vice-Chair, Facilitated by Commissioner Rechtschaffen- Action Item***

*Motion to re-elect Board Member Castaneda as LIOB chair; motion moved by Board Member Watts, seconded by Board Member Toledo (Yes: Vice-Chair Delgado-Olson, Commissioner Rechtschaffen, Board Members Davidson, Watts, Wimbley, Toledo, Linam, Stamas and Hernandez; motion passed) (Abstentions: Chairman Castaneda) Motion to re-elect Board Member Delgado-Olson as LIOB Vice-Chair; motioned moved by Board Member Watts , seconded by Board Member Toledo (Yes: Chairman Castaneda, Commissioner Rechtschaffen, Board Members Davidson, Watts, Wimbley, Toledo, Linam, Stamas and Hernandez; motion passed,) (Abstentions: Vice-Chair Delgado-Olson)*

1. ***Public Comments— Facilitated by Chair Castañeda - Informational/Standing Item***

*No public comments were offered.*

1. [***Approval of the December 6th, 2017 LIOB Meeting Minutes***](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Approved%20Meeting%20Minutes%20of%20the%20LIOB%20120617%20Approved%20at%20the%20030818%20LIOBmtg.docx)***, Facilitated by Chair Castañeda- Action Item***

*Motion: Board Member Castaneda moved and Board Member Toledo seconded a motion for approval of the minutes of December 6th, 2017. Yes: Chairman Castañeda, Commissioner Rechtschaffen, Vice- Chairman Delgado-Olson, Board Members Watts, Wimbley, Toledo, Linam, Hernandez, Stamas and Davidson; motion passed. (No Abstentions)*

1. ***Recognition to Original LIOB Member Ortensia Lopez for 15 years of service***

*The Board recognized original LIOB Member, Ortensia Lopez for her commitment and leadership to improving the quality of life to underserved communities and for assisting the California Public Utilities Commission in fulfilling its mission to maximize the benefits of utility, state and federal low income programs to improve the health, safety and comfort of low income customers. The Board looks forward to continuing working with Board Member Lopez.*

1. ***Announcement of New Board Members - Facilitated by Commissioner Rechtschaffen***

*Commissioner Rechtschaffen announced at its March 1, 2018 meeting, the Commission approved the appointment of Ms. Maria Stamas from Natural Resources Defense Councils and the re-appointment of Board Members Patricia Watt-**Private Weatherization Contractor Representative, Jeff Linam - Water Corporation Representative, Larry Gross - public member, and Jason Wimbley- Department of Community Services and Development Representative.*

1. ***CPUC Standing Reports:***
2. [Legislative Update – Office of Governmental Affairs](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Item%207a.%20CPUC%20LIOB%20Legislative%20%20Update%20LIOB030818.pdf)

*Hazel Miranda provided a brief update on pending Legislative Bills, Ms. Miranda noted that the bills are in different stages of development and that the PUC does not have a position on any of the Bills.*

*Board Member Wimbley Jason Wimbley reported that in the Governor’s proposed 18-19 budget, there is no additional appropriation of GGRF (Greenhouse Gas Reduction Fund) to CSD for the LIWP (low income weatherization program). The low-income multi-family will continue using prior year appropriation; however, the programs that are directly impacted will be the statewide solar program and the statewide weatherization program.*

*The legislative subcommittee will schedule a meeting to discuss and provide recommendations to the full Board.*

1. [Water Utilities’ Current Issues – Kevin Truong](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Item%207b.%20Water%20Utilities%27%20Current%20Issues%20LIOB030818.pptx)

*Kevin Truong provided an update on the current water issues and the CPUC’s Strategic Directive SD-04 “water affordability”. Commissioner Rechtschaffen mentioned that the Commission is grappling with questions of affordability more general, not just for water, but electricity, gas and maybe telecommunications. The Board was encouraged to follow this issue closely. The Board asked why median household Income levels were used. The board also suggested looking at the impacts of water cost on different levels of income. Mr. Truong also reported on the school lead testing, the CPUC requests quarterly reporting of testing progress for the CPUC’s regulated water utilities, he also reported on the passing of Assembly Bill 746 (Gonzalez), which requires all community water systems serving a school built before 2010 to test for lead.*

1. [Lifeline Telephone Program Update – Tribal Lifeline Program – Anna Jew](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Item%207c.%20California%20LifeLine%20Presentation%20LIOB030818%20FINAL%20rev2.ppt)

*Anna Jew provided an update on the Lifeline Telephone Program. The Moore Act requires the Commission to try and reach the greatest number of low income households in California. Commissioner Rechtschaffen issued a Decision last December to increase the coordination between the Lifeline program and the CARE program; strategies are being developed in order to increase the participation rate. It was also mentioned that fire victims are automatically renewed. Fe Lazaro informed the Board that the ULTSAC is still in existence. Communications will be seeking the assistance of the Public Advisor’s office to conduct marketing outreach with respect to the Tribal areas.*

*Commissioner Guzman Aceves, the assigned Commissioner on Lifeline proceeding commented that there has been a lot of transition in this program and that the biggest transition is from landline to wireless and this transition has led to decreases in meeting the eligibility goals. Commissioner Guzman Aceves added that there is a big crisis with the current administration and that this program is currently constrained to Federal rules and eligibility. Commissioner Guzman Aceves expressed the need to hear the concerns and indicated if the Trump Administration and the FCC have its way, the current infrastructure for providing the service would not be eligible for federal funding. Commissioner Guzman Aceves also expressed concern about the elimination of the port freeze and the conflict this creates as there are requirements in State law to have a freeze. In closing, she stated that there needs to be a clear vision on where this program is going and there needs to be a lot more engagement from the stakeholders, and CBO’s. The Board thanked Commissioner Guzman Aceves for her comments and participation.*

1. [Recent and Upcoming Activities for Energy Programs – Energy Division](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Item%207d.%20Highlights%20Activities%20for%20Low%20Income%20Energy%20Program%20LINA%20Status%20LIOB030818.pptx)

*Syreeta Gibbs provided a high level presentation on the recent and upcoming activities for energy programs. Ms. highlighted that the IOU’s conforming advice letters and resolutions were approved on December 14, 2017. The final resolutions authorized approximately $316M in unspent ESA funds and approximately $9M in additional CARE funds to implement decision directives. Ms. Gibbs also reported that the statutory deadline to complete the next LINA study is December 2019, Research Into Action and DNV-GL were selected to conduct the study. There will be opportunities for stakeholder engagement and interested stakeholders will have an opportunity to weigh in and provide input into the draft research plan. The report also included an update on the ESA multifamily from the Multifamily Working Group Facilitator, Ms. Caroline Chen.*

***8. Special Reports/Updates – Informational/Action Items***

1. [Stephanie Green – Tribal Liaison](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Item%208a.%20CPUC%20Tribal%20Consultation%20Policy%20LIOB030818%20FINAL.pptx)

*Stephanie Green provided an overview of the recent CPUC Draft Tribal Consultation Policy. Executive Order B-10-11 ordered that all State of California agencies develop a policy to encourage communication and consultation with California Indian Tribe and to give meaningful representation and input from the Tribes in the regulation rules and policies. Ms. Green has been appointed as the Tribal Liaison. Ms. Green has already started working with the different IOU’s to talk about their ESA outreach and engagement and the different strategies that they will be using to outreach the Tribes. Board member Wimbley mentioned that CSD is putting together a pilot that will emphasize in weatherization services to Tribal areas, particularity those in Northern CA. This would be a great opportunity to collaborate and work together on lessons learned from this pilot. Ms. Green looks forward to working and collaborating with the IOU’s, CSD and this Board.*

1. [Update: Disadvantaged Communities Advisory Group – Alice Glasner](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Item%208b.%20Disadvantaged%20Communities%20Advisory%20Group%20LIOB030818.pptx)

*Selection of LIOB liaison with Disadvantaged Communities Advisory Group - Action Item*

*Alice Glasner provided an overview of the Disadvantaged Communities Advisory Group. SB 350 requires a focus on disadvantaged communities, to consider impacts on disadvantaged communities in the CPUC decision making processes, to improve access to programs in disadvantaged communities, to prioritize air quality improvements, to target economic benefits. Ms. Glasner commented that the CEC has issued a report titled* [*The Energy Commission's Tracking Progress report - Energy Equity Indicators*](http://docketpublic.energy.ca.gov/PublicDocuments/18-IEPR-08/TN222833_20180302T141156_Tracking_Progress__Energy_Equity_Indicators.pdf) *and the CPUC, CED and ARB will hold a joint public workshop in late summer to discuss the progress.*

*Commissioner Rechtschaffen commented that it is important for this Board to define the relationship between the LIOB and the Disadvantaged Communities Advisory Group, and although there might be some overlapping, there are some differences in focus and priority. The LIOB should follow some of the initiatives of the group and provide comments as appropriate, either as individuals or as a group.*

*The Board elected Board Member Maria Stamas as the liaison for the Disadvantaged Communities Advisory Group and Chairman Castaneda as an alternate. (motion moved by Chairman Castaneda , seconded by Board Member Toledo (Yes: Chairman Castañeda, Commissioner Rechtschaffen, Vice- Chairman Delgado-Olson, Board Members Watts, Wimbley, Toledo, Linam, Stamas and Davidson; motion passed)*

1. [Update: TEAM and CHANGES – Public Advisor’s Office](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Item%208c.%20TEAM%20and%20CHANGES%20Presentation%20LIOB%20030818Final.pptx)

*Ravinder Mangat from the News & Outreach Office provided an update on the Telecommunications Education and Assistance in Multiple-languages (TEAM) and the Consumer Help and Awareness of Natural Gas and Electricity Services (CHANGES). Mr. Mangat has been working with the utilities to get more data on Solar to find resolution to this issue. News & Outreach Office is also working with Communications Division to address the Lifeline issues. Evaluation of the CHANGES program will be conducted by a contractor to evaluate the CHANGES program and how well the program is working. Ms. Casey McFall provided highlights of the activities in TEAM and CHANGES program.*

1. Coordination Report of CSD and IOU on Low Income Weatherization Program (LIWP) Jason Wimbley, CSD

*Board member Wimbley reported that the data sharing is making steady progress, since the last meeting, CSD has completed the first successful data exchange of information between CSD and the IOU’s. CSD will continue to refine the process. On the Multi-Family the focus is to look at ways to successfully incorporate ESA funding into the low income multi-family projects that have been funded under the Department’s low income weatherization program. This program provides energy efficiency and renewable energy systems to low income multi-family housing in disadvantaged communities. This has been a very complex issue; however, within the past month CSD has made some major headway.*

***9. Technical Advisory Committee Update (Board Members Delgado-Olson & Wimbley)***

*a. Updates on Progress and Presentation on CARE Penetration Rate Mapping*

*Vice-Chairman reported that the TAC had a formal meeting with the participation of Secretary Diana Dooley Office from Health and Human Services through her external Affairs Deputy Secretary. With the IOUs’ support the TAC collected zip data for CARE and ESA penetration rates including numbers and percentages. They’ve also collected disconnection data from 3 of the 4 IOU’s by zip codes as well as data from CALFRESH, CALWORKS, MEDI-CAL. The idea is to develop and streamline enrollment into these program through existing public assistance programs. The TAC will provide a subsequent report that will include more detail, geospatial, to show correlations between disconnections and also some of the low penetration rates for these other program. Vice-Chairman Delgado-Olson thanked Rahil Maharaj for all of his work on this project.*

***10.*** [***Joint Investor Owned Utilities’ Reports - Informational/ Standing Item***](http://liob.cpuc.ca.gov/Docs/Item%2010.%20IOU%20Reports%20for%20LIOB030818%20FINAL%20revised.pptx)

1. Joint IOU’s Report of the California Alternate Rates for Energy (CARE) and Energy Savings Assistance (ESA) programs including LIOB and Aliso Canyon updates
	* Report by county and zip code of ESA penetration rates >= 100% (follow up from 12/6/17 LIOB mtg)
	* Low Income Solar Program
	* Smart Thermostats and Energy Management Technology & Education for Low Income Customers – Erin Brooks- SoCalGas

*Ms. Mary O’Drain provided a high leveled report on the CARE and ESA programs on behalf of the PG&E and the other IOUs. The reports are based on the end-of-year report. Ms. Erin Brooks provided a report on Smart Thermostats and Energy Management Technology and explained that the ESA program doesn’t have smart thermostats as a measure. SoCalGas proposed to include Smart Thermostats in the ESA program it in their Advice Letter, and the other utilities are all exploring to include them in the mid-cycle filing. All of the IOU’s filed to conduct a programmable communicating thermostats pilot. Commissioner Rechtschaffen would like a report back on how successful the utilities are in their targeted energy management outreach to low income communities. Mayda Bandy of SDG&E and Mauro Dresti of SCE provided a brief on their Energy Storage proposal.*

**11.** ***Adoption of the Statement of Guiding Principles for the LIOB – Chairman - Action Item***

*Motion moved by Chairman Castaneda to adopt the Statement of Guiding Principles for the LIOB with the amendments as noted on items 3 and 4 , seconded by Board Member Davidson (Yes: Chairman Castaneda, Commissioner Rechtschaffen, Board Members Davidson, Watts, Wimbley, Toledo, Linam and Stamas; motion passed)*

***12. Subcommittee Reports and Updates – Standing/Action/Discussion Item***

a. Low Income Energy Assistance Program (Board Members Castaneda, Watts, Wimbley and Davidson)

* Approval of the Draft Letter of the Health, Comfort and Safety Provision with the ESA program

*Item was moved to a future meeting*

1. Water and Climate Subcommittee (Board Members Delgado-Olson, Castaneda and Toledo) **no update**
2. Legislative Subcommittee (Board Members Hernandez and Delgado-Olson) Update

*This item was discussed during the Legislative update.*

1. Low Income Needs Assessment (LINA) (Board Members Delgado-Olson, Hernandez, and Davidson ) **no** *update*

*Motion moved by Chairman Castaneda to reassigned the existing Board Members to the subcommittees that they are currently serving, and to appoint Board Member Maria Stamas to the Low Income Energy Assistance seconded by Commissioner Rechtschaffen (Yes: Chairman Castaneda, Commissioner Rechtschaffen, Board Members Davidson, Watts, Wimbley, Toledo, Linam and Stamas; motion passed)*

***13.* Future Meetings Dates, Location & Agenda Items - *Discussion Item***

*Staff introduced Alison LaBonte the new supervisor for the Residential Programs and Portfolio Approval Section in the Energy Efficiency Branch. Prior to the CPUC, Alison was a program manager at the U.S. Department of Energy and responsible for the marine energy technology research and development portfolio.*

Suggested Dates/Locations:

|  |
| --- |
| 2018 |
| June 8th, 2018  | Sacramento |
| September – Date TBD | Recommended Location San Bernardino or Inland Empire and or Riverside County |
| December Date TBD  | Stockton |