**Low Income Oversight Board Meeting (LIOB)**

**September 22, 2016**

**Eureka City Hall**

**Council Chambers  
531 "K" Street  
Eureka, CA 95501**

**Sacramento, CA**

**Call - In Number 1-866-642-1440 - Passcode 7516937#**

[**www.liob.org**](http://www.liob.org)

**To Access the Video Webcast of the LIOB meeting, please visit:**<https://archive.org/details/AH-hpc_9-22-16>

**Approved Meeting Minutes**

**Meeting Called to order at 10:10am by Chairman Castañeda**

***LIOB Board Members Present:***

*Chairman Robert Castañeda, Vice-Chairman Benito Delgado-Olson, Commissioner Catherine J.K. Sandoval, Jose Atilio Hernandez, Patricia Watts, Jeff Linam, Mark Wallenrod, Jason Wimbley and Charlie Toledo*

***LIOB Members Absent:***

*Larry Gross, Ortensia Lopez (via conference as public member)*

***California Public Utilities Commission (CPUC) Staff Present:***

*Hazlyn Fortune, Jamie Ormond, Michael Colvin & Zaida Amaya*

***Public Present:***

*Sean McLaughlin, Roberto DelReal, Giovanna Casillas, Rebecca Baez-Huntsman, Arleen Novotney, Val Martinez, Mark Aguirre, Mary O’Drain, Sheila Lee*

***Via Conference:***

*Marna Anning, Joy Yamagata, Patti Landry, Yvette Vazquez, Ted Humphrey, Tina Nguyen, Gregory Buchler, Luis Lopez, Allen Fernandez Smith, Vanessa Melvin-Gunn, Allan Rago, inaudiable*

1. **Welcome and Introductions— Robert Castañeda, LIOB Chair and Commissioner Catherine J.K. Sandoval -*Standing Item***

*Chairman Castañeda noted the removal of item 8 from the agenda.*

*Chairman Castañeda welcomed Board Member Mark Wallenrod as the newest member of the LIOB; Board Member Wallenrod is the new utility representative from SCE, his appointment was approved by the Commission on August 18th, 2016.*

*Chairman Castañeda and Commissioner Sandoval welcomed all present to the Low Income Oversight Board Meeting in Eureka and thanked Eureka City Hall for hosting the LIOB meeting.*

*The Board thanked Mr. Sean McLaughlin, Executive Director from Access Humboldt providing the recording services to the LIOB.*

**2. Public Comments— Facilitated by Robert Castañeda, LIOB Chair - *Informational/Standing item***

*Mr. Sean McLaughlin, Executive Director from Access Humboldt, manages community media and broadband access for residents of Humboldt County and adjacent Tribal areas; he also serves as the Chair of the California Teleconnect Fund Administrative Committee (CTF-AC). Mr. McLaughlin emphasized on the importance that programs such as Lifeline offers to underserved areas, he mentioned that it is very difficult to outreach and make people aware and make them comfortable to sign-up for these program. Mr. McLaughlin acknowledged Commissioner Sandoval’s work on this particular program and thanked her for the hearings she has convened in this region. Besides the Lifeline program, Mr. McLaughlin also mentioned the CTAF discounts that work in conjunction with the federal E-rates subsidy as well as the 2-1-1 program, which is a free phone number and online database that connects Californians quickly and effectively to existing health and human service programs, joblessness support and disaster response information in their communities. It is available 24 hours a day, 7 days a week and in 150 different languages. All of these programs are vital for the underserved communities.*

*Ms. Val Martinez, Executive Director of Redwood Community Action Agency and a member of the Association of California of Community and Energy Services Board of Directors, spoke before the board to comment on the CARE capitation contract and poor follow through communications in the PG&E service territory. Ms. Martinez stated that Redwood has tried unsuccessfully for the past three years plus to secure a CARE capitation contract, even after submitting the required documents and application in December 2015 and it wasn’t until recently that PG&E has contacted them to assist them with this process. Ms. Martinez has spoken with other LIHEAP service providers in the PG&E service territory, and has found that the level of frustration is high and that the problems are consistent. Ms. Martinez asks for the support of the LIOB, as this is a very important program that helps the less fortunate in communities throughout California.*

*Board Member Wimbley commented that last year they served 225,000 low income customers in the state, this number does not include the various individuals that have come to the various organizations to seek services, this merely represents those that were served. Board Member Wimbley added that the services and programs that they provide are 100% income verified required, in order to comply with the Federal standards. Board Member Wimbley stressed the importance of collaboration with the utilities. He also mentioned that their Cap-and-Trade programs are launching, which is another dimension of services that CSD is providing that creates another opportunity for their clients that are interested in seeking ways to use their financial energy burdens.*

*Chairman Castañeda mentioned that PG&E has reached out is committed to assisting in this endeavor and get these issues resolved.*

*Board Member Hernandez commented that per Statue the Board is required to assist in streamlining the application and enrollment process of programs for low income electricity and gas customers with general low income programs. What would it take for the Board to take a deeper dive on this issue.*

*Vice-Chairman Delgado-Olson commented that the Board has been discussing the creation of a technical advisory committee, which can have any charge that is related to the functions of the LIOB. Board Member Delgado-Olson expects to formally take action at the Long Beach meeting to formally create this technical advisory committee.*

*Mr. Allan Rago from the Energy Efficiency Council (EEC) commented on the ESA program. The Strategic Plan, D.08-11-031 challenged the IOUs to devise and implement outreach and training efforts to teach minority, low income, and other disadvantaged communities the skills needed to succeed at jobs that support the ESA program. The Commission authorized $11,135,366 dollars of ratepayer funds between 2009-2015 for training the ESA workforce with the skills required to work in the ESA program. To implement this Commission direction , and armed with more than eleven million dollars of ratepayer funds, utilities worked to build a workforce of CBO’s, Diverse Business Enterprises and private contractors to deliver energy savings to low-income communities. Many of these companies made significant investments in trucks, buildings, equipment and more importantly they made investments in employees, which he added the Commission should not take lightly. The health of contractors and their ability to provide good paying jobs with career ladders should be recognized as one of the main benefits of the ESA program and the Commission should take action to protect the employees and companies they set in place. Mr. Rago referenced the presentation at the July 20th, 2016 LIOB meeting, “ESA: A Program in Crisis”, which outlined the continued decline in the workforce. Mr. Rage asks for the Board’s support on implementing a course of correction.*

*Board Member Watts agreed with the comments made by EEC and added that contractors put money upfront to train people and to find qualified customers. Most contractors hire full time staff, which means they are paying living wages, providing benefits, health insurance, 401K’s and all of the components that to into acquiring a customer. She added that there needs to be a deeper dive into the acquisition piece, which is a separate piece from the cost of treatment.*

*Chairman Castañeda and Board Member Watts agreed that this discussion and possible solutions could be addressed through the Mid-Cycle Working Grouping. Board Member Watts added that this conversation needs to continue with input from everyone and come out with something that is really impactful to the program. Everyone is seeking the same goal of targeting low income customers and collaboration is key, and that there is no need for multiple agencies to qualify the customers.*

*Board Member Hernandez commented that there is urgency to this issue and due to the fact that the LIOB cant’ be a formal party in a proceeding, he asked on the best approach for the LIOB to advice the PUC.*

*Chairman Castañeda commented that both he and Vice-Chair Delgado-Olson have been working on specific changes to the LIOB that would empower, identify and enable this type of communication. They are looking at instituting a technical advisory committee to work with specific issues and to identify conduit of communication to the Commission and the protocol, procedure and appropriateness on how to achieve this. Vice Chair Delgado-Olson added that they intend to discuss this at the November LIOB meeting and stated that this is a very diverse Board, as it represents State agencies, contractors, utilities, Commissioners and public members and careful consideration needs to be taken on how things are managed. He added that the Statue is clear that the Board’s job is to advice the Commission; however, it is not clear or specific as to how to achieve that, thus added that for transparency purposes, any votes on policies should be through a committee process, which would give people a chance to participate. He also mentioned that the website is being re-designed and it will have simple functions to provide comments and questions to the Board as well as looking at proceedings that are relevant to the LIOB.*

*Commissioner Sandoval commented that as mentioned at the last Commission meeting, and in light of the proposals, and the alternate to use some of the ESA funding for Multi-Family housing, Legal believes that the APD needs to be served to the previous service list. Revisions to the APD are being made and will be served by the end of week. Once that happens, there will be an opportunity for comments and replies from the old service list, Commissioner added that her proposal includes changes regarding multi-family. Procedurally, anyone may file comments on revision 2 of the alternate. Parties can file comments on the revision APD, but also any member of the public can file letters with the CPUC. There will be a 20 day comment period with a 5 day reply comment period. The Public Advisor’s office can provide details on how to file comments.*

**3. Approval of the July 20th, 2016 LIOB Meeting Minutes, Facilitated by Robert Castañeda, LIOB Chair- *Action Item***

*Motion to approve the July 20th, 2016 minutes, with amendments/corrections made by Vice-Chair Delgado Olson to items 2 and 13. Seconded by Board Member Toledo. (Yes: Chairman Castañeda, Vice Chairman Delgado-Olson, Commissioner Sandoval, Board Members Linam, Watts, Toledo, Lopez, Hernandez, Wimbley and Wallenrod; motion passed) Item 2 to highlight the statement made by Mr. David Doung, owner and operator of Atlas Systems Incorporated regarding the closing of his Sonoma County. Item 13. To clarify that the telephone survey, which produces the data and the way it is currently constructed, leaves 1 out of 5 people out.*

**4. Discussion on the Decision of the Large Investor-Owned Utilities’ California Alternate Rates for Energy (CARE) and Energy Savings Assistance (ESA) Programs Applications** - ***Discussion/Action Item* -**

*Commissioner Sandoval commented as that there are ongoing activities with regard to bridge funding, as well as ramp up activities, particularly in Southern California in the areas affected by Aliso Canyon and due to the state of emergency in that area, the Commission suspended the number of the rules. SCE and SoCalGas have been working very closely with the contractor community and also coordinating with LADWP. Commissioner Sandoval also reported that in the interim between the last LIOB and this meeting, the Commission, in conjunction with a number of State agencies, held an update meeting on Aliso Canyon. This meeting was held on the Diamond Bar community and it was focused on looking at the winter projections in terms of where we are at now with Aliso Canyon. The Commission also received a report from one of the national labs who did an independent analysis and the risk factors for Aliso Canyon. The National Laboratory, Lawrence Livermore reported that they believed that the number should be revised to 12 days of potential blackouts in Los Angeles, as opposed to 14 days in terms of the risk factors coming from Aliso Canyon. There is an action plan moving forward, and plan of this plan is to avoid having 12 day of blackouts in Southern California. This would include really stepping up efforts on energy efficiency as well stepping up efforts on demand response. These are absolutely critical while the Commission looks at other issues to address the energy needs associated with Aliso Canyon. Commissioner Sandoval highlighted that one of the things that is proposed in the APD is that ESA would also help to enable a number of programs that crossed between energy efficiency and demand response. Commissioner invites comments and reply comments to the revised APD. Commissioner Sandoval thanked Energy Division, Judge Colbert as well as ALJ Division for working together with her office, as they look at different policies proposal and options and thanked all of the individuals who have commented, she specially thanked Michael Colvin who has worked with her on these revisions. Finally Commissioner Sandoval wanted to ensure to everyone that all of the Commissioners have had attention to this issue and mentioned that there has already been a rate setting deliberate meeting noticed to talk about these issues and plan to notice another rate setting deliberate meeting in October.*

**5. Highlights of Upcoming Activities for Low-Income Energy Programs – Energy Division Staff - Standing Item**

1. **Update: Low Income Needs Assessment (LINA)**

*Ms. Hazlyn Fortune provided an update on the Low Income Needs Assessment report. Ms. Fortune reported that the research and data collection have been completed, a draft report will be available in October 2016 and a workshop will be scheduled in October as well. An updated draft report will be issued in November pursuant to comments receive, and a final report will be issued in December 2016. Ms. Fortune clarified that the comments made by Vice Chairman Delgado-Olson regarding the telephone survey is an important issue and has been noted, and will make sure that as the next LINA study is scoped that this issue is included and accounted for. Ms. Fortuned also reported that the Proposed Decision and Alternate Proposed Decisions addressing IOU 2015-2017 the CARE and ESA program applications were issued on August 16, 2016, parties filed opening comments on the proposed decisions on September 6, 2016 and submitted reply comments on September 12, 2016. The decisions and stakeholder comments are currently under review in preparation for a Commission vote and adoption of a final decision. Ms. Fortune also reported on the current activity going on at the California Energy Commission (CEC) with the disadvantaged communities. A draft report has been issued by CEC and the Board is encouraged to review the draft report, written comments are due on September 29th, 2016. Another revision will be produced in November and an opportunity for comments. This report is scheduled to be finalized by the CEC in December.*

**6. Energy Investor Owned Utilities Reports – Utility Representatives - Standing /Discussion Item**

1. **Good News, Positive Program Developments and Areas Requiring Improvement**
   * + 1. **CARE Enrollment Penetration and Expenditures**
       2. **ESA Homes Treated and Program Expenditures**
       3. **Projected Year-End Expenditures and Unspent Funds**

*The IOU’s (SCE, SoCalGas, SDG&E and PG&E) provided a summary of their CARE Enrollment, Penetration and Expenditures as well as their homes treated and Projected Year-End Expenditures and Unspent funds.*

*Mr. Roberto DelReal from SCE reported that as a result of the Aliso Canyon decision, SCE worked with the Chemehuevi Tribal Nation, this effort was completed by working with the Tribal Council and Housing Authorities, through this effort, SCE was able to reach most if not all members of this tribe for the first time. SCE hopes to replicate this process in other tribes moving forward. Mr. DelReal stated that SCE has made a lot of technology improvements, some of them were generated due to Aliso Canyon and others because they have been working alongside the Gas Company to try to align the program. He also noted that Aliso Canyon also gave them the opportunity to make some adjustments to their marketing efforts and target customers in the Aliso Canyon specific areas through the go-back-rule and the three measurement minimum rule and that through the removal of the go-back-rule and the 3 measurement minimum rule for the Aliso Canyon area, there has been a significant increase in program enrollment opportunities. Mr. DelReal reported that unlike the lack of work mentioned by some contractors, SCE is experiencing the opposite problem. SCE has a lot of work and is working through the process of trying to increase their contractor network in order to complete back-logged work. He also reported that SCE has created a mobile application that will be launching early next year, which will allow contractors to enroll for both programs at the same time. Some of the areas of challenges for SCE is running 2 programs, which is challenging and they have to manage 2 sets of programs with different rules*, however, if the *decision passes that suspends the rules for the entire program, SCE has a system in place that they can just turn on and move on.*

*Commissioner Sandoval thanked SCE for their report and commented that the Chemehuevi Tribe project is a great model and mentioned that the person designated to this project is a member of the Chemehuevi Tribe. Commissioner Sandoval suggested that this model could be used in terms of telephone issues. She mentioned that at the call completion public participation hearing in Middletown Rancheria, it was mentioned that all of the Tribal members share the same address as the hotel and the casino, and that there is no consistent addressing data base, which poses a challenge for Lifeline discount as well as calling 911 if case of an emergency, as 911 can’t tell which house they are in, due to the fact that they all have the same address.*

*The Board asked for a report about this project at the next LIOB meeting.*

*Mr. Mark Aguirre of SoCalGas reported on their partnerships with Anaheim Public Utilities, Los Angeles Department of Water& Power and Riverside Public Utilities, he also mentioned their success with the integration of Edison’s and SoCalGas’ contractor training initiatives, SoCal Gas is exploring the use of the online store to promote a common uniform for SCE and SCG and ESA program contractors. In the areas of improvement, Mr. Aguirre mentioned on the inspection criteria between cities and counties and the challenges for HVAC contractors. Ms. Regina Lugani reported on their marketing and outreach methods, she reported that they have held 5 media round tables, 36 community partner and 23 media outlets, these were held in Spanish, Vietnamese and Chinese in the San Bernardino and Ventura area. In addition, SoCalGas developed a marketing effort to target “can’t reach” customers assessed for high efficiency clothes washers. Under their positive program developments, SoCalGas has a new partnership with the City of Colton to serve joint customers and a collaboration and co-branded materials with IRWD and SCE for water/energy nexus in the city of Irvine. In the areas of improvement, SoCalGas is working on their non-responders and can’t reach customers as well as give more attention to additional communication channel with mobile, not just email and mobile apps, but also text to SMS.*

*Mary O’Drain of PG&E reported that PG&E has been meeting on the community engagement front, and have been meeting with community ambassadors, who are typically CARE outreach contractors who are going to be doing more work and will be providing increase customer service to CARE customers, which includes PEV follow ups, more integrated low income programming and educating clients on rate change awareness issues. Ms. O’Drain reported that in the middle of August they held a series of 10 focus groups, these were with enrolled eligible CARE customers in Oakland, Fresno and San Luis Obispo, these were in English, Chinese and Spanish. These focus groups were to help gather more insight into more strategies for reaching CARE customers, specific to CARE but there was also good information about ESA customers, when probed about the ESA awareness, many customers had participated in the program and were satisfied with the results. PG&E will be using the data from these focus groups to help update CARE collateral and also ESA collateral materials and using this information to assist them prepare for outreach in 2017. On the integrated planning front, PG&E has been part of the PG&E settlement since 2014, and has been hosting a series of community advisory group on communities of color, there are more than 20 organizations represented in these groups and they help advice PG&E on issues related to their customer assistance programs. They provide various targeted community outreach through different events, workshops and different face to face types of communication to assist customers, primarily CARE enrollment and rate awareness, but there is also good information for ESA customers as well. PG&E has also been doing call center collaboration to help decrease their work load; at this point PG&E has achieved a case load reduction of over 50%. The call centers are handling the customer inquiries better and faster.*

*Ms. Giovanna Casillas of SDG&E reported that SDG&E has stared their new CARE enrollment live with their energy service specialist within their call center; so far it has been very successful. So far just in the month of September they have had over 100 enrollments, and although this is for CARE enrollment, any new customer that is on CARE that hasn’t been served by ESA receives a call from their ESA contractor. Ms. Casillas also reported on their success with their multi-tactic marketing approach, in conjunction with some of their mass media, which includes TV, print, social media and online advertisement, SDG&E is using a multi-tactic approach with their direct mail, door-to-door, and live call campaigns to their high density and rule neighborhoods. This tactic is near doubling their enrollment for their CARE and ESA customers and although each of the tactics all on their own are fairly successful, when they pair these approaches, customers tend to enroll much easier this way.*

*Commissioner Sandoval asked the IOU’s to report at the next LIOB meeting on the number of federally recognized tribes located in their territory.*

*The Board thanked the utilities for their Good News report and encouraged the IOU’s to continue their good work.*

**7. Subcommittee Reports and Updates – Facilitated by Robert Castañeda, LIOB Chair - *Standing /Action/Discussion Item***

1. **Marketing & Outreach (Board Members Toledo, Gross, Watts & Delgado-Olson)**

*The Marketing & Outreach Subcommittee did not meet.*

*Motion by Board Member Delgado-Olson for Board Member Wallenrod to join the Marketing & Outreach Subcommittee. Seconded by Chair Castañeda. (Yes: Chairman Castañeda, Vice Chairman Delgado-Olson, Commissioner Sandoval, Board Members Linam, Watts, Toledo, Lopez, Hernandez, Wimbley and Wallenrod; motion passed)*

1. **ESAP and CARE Implementation (Board Members Castañeda, Wimbley, Watts & Lopez)**

*The ESAP and CARE Implementation subcommittee did not meet.*

*Motion by Board Member Toledo for Board member Wallenrod to join the ESAP and CARE Implementation Subcommittee. Seconded by Board Member Toledo. (Yes: Chairman Castañeda, Vice Chairman Delgado-Olson, Commissioner Sandoval, Board Members Linam, Watts, Toledo, Lopez, Hernandez, Wimbley and Wallenrod; motion passed)*

1. **Workforce Education and Training (Board Members Hernandez & Castañeda)**

*The Workforce Education and Training subcommittee did not meet.*

1. **Water Industry (Board Members Linam, Lopez and Castañeda)**

*The Water Industry did not meet.*

1. **Emerging Issues/Climate Change (Board Members Toledo & Delgado-Olson)**

*Motion by Board Member Toledo for Board Member Hernandez to join the Emerging Issues/Climate Change Subcommittee. Seconded by Chairman Castañeda. (Yes: Chairman Castañeda, Vice Chairman Delgado-Olson, Commissioner Sandoval, Board Members Linam, Watts, Toledo, Lopez, Hernandez, Wimbley and Wallenrod; motion passed)*

1. **AB 327 Subcommittee (Board Members Hernandez, Lopez, & Wimbley)**

The AB 327 Subcommittee did not meet.

*Commissioner Sandoval provided a report on the 2-1-1 workshop and public participation hearing held on July 16, 2016 in Eureka. One of the issues that was brought up at the meeting by 2-1-1 Humboldt was that they had experienced problems where there were reports of some people including some callers who were calling from the temporary assistance for needy family office (TANF) at the Hoopa Reservation located in Hoopa, CA and reported that when they tried to call the short code of 2-1-1 from the Hoopa TANF office in Humboldt, they got a message that said that the number has been disconnected or no longer in service. As a result of this, they also heard that there were reports of some local businesses in Eureka who had received these messages as well. As a result of this issue, Commissioner Sandoval issued an Assigned Commissioner Ruling which addressed a number of themes that were brought up in the workshops that they’ve had, but specifically order the carriers who serve the Humboldt area to meet and conferred and try to figure out what happened. At the call completion workshop on Tuesday held in Santa Cruz, it was reported that AT&T and Frontier are continuing to work together to figure out what happened. AT&T reported that they thought that the call was not getting through because they suggested that the Hoopa TANF office is in Trinity County, and that since Trinity County doesn’t have a 2-1-1 this is the reason why it wasn’t getting through to Humboldt county 2-1-1. Commissioner Sandoval commented that they’ve had the pleasure of visiting there before, and most assuredly Hoopa California and the Hoopa TANF office is in Humboldt County. Commissioner Sandoval has asked the communication division is to chase this down. In this interaction between Frontier system and AT&T system is the system reading these calls as from Trinity because this is the meet point when the calls originate in fact from Humboldt. This is something that the Commission is tracking.*

**8. Legislative Update – CPUC- Office of Governmental Affairs – Informational/Standing Item**

*Office of Governmental Affairs will provide an update at the November LIOB meeting.*

**9. Future Dates & Agenda Items for Future Meeting - Discussion Item**

*Commissioner Sandoval thanked the Board for coming to Eureka.*

*LIOB Resources – Vice-Chairman Benito Delgado-Olson*

*Discussion on the Decision of the Large Investor-Owned Utilities’ California Alternate Rates for Energy (CARE) and Energy Savings Assistance (ESA) Programs*

*SCE’s Presentation on the Chemehuevi Project*

*Update: Aliso Canyon - Southern California Edison & Southern California Gas Company*

*Meeting adjourned at 2:35pm*

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Tuesday, November 22, 2016**  Long Beach City Hall  333 W Ocean Blvd.  Long Beach, CA 90802 |  |