**Low Income Oversight Board Meeting (LIOB)**

**Tuesday, February 23rd, 2016**

**California Public Utilities Commission**

**Auditorium**

**505 Van Ness Avenue**

**San Francisco, CA 94102**

**Call - In Number 1-866-642-1440 - Passcode 7516937#**

[**www.liob.org**](http://www.liob.org)

**Approved Meeting Minutes**

The archived video webcast of this meeting is accessible at: <http://www.adminmonitor.com/ca/cpuc/other/20160223/>

**Meeting Called to order at 10:08am by Chairman Castañeda**

***LIOB Board Members Present:***

*Chairman Robert Castañeda, Vice-Chairwoman Patricia Watts, Commissioner Catherine J.K. Sandoval, Jeff Linam, Dan Rendler, Benito Delgado-Olson, Ortensia Lopez, Jason Wimbley and Charlie Toledo*

***LIOB Members Absent:***

*Jose Atilio Hernandez and Larry Gross*

***California Public Utilities Commission (CPUC) Staff Present:***

*Commissioner Liane Randolph, Rachel Peterson, Leuwan Tesfai, Hazlyn Fortune, Tory Francisco, Lisa Paulo, Syreeta Gibbs, , Jamie Ormond, Michael Colvin, Carl Danner, Kyle DeVine, Rami Kahlon, Juanita Hill, Fe Lazaro, Jonathan Lakritz, Anna Jew, Kevin Troung and Zaida Amaya*

***Public Present:***

*Sheila Lee, Vanessa Melvin-Gunn, Mark Aguirre, Yvette Vasquez, Kelly Prasser, Giovanna Casillas, Emma Ponco, Patti Landry, Mary O’Drain, Mauricio Blanco, David Ortiz, Jose Landeros, Mauricio Blanco, Regina Lugani, Anne Gressani, Jack Hawks, Ann Gressani, Allan Rago, Richard Villasenor, Lisa McNalley, James Hodges, Arleen Novotney, Allen Fernandez Smith, Susan Walters, Anna Solorio, Sean Simon, Lauri Walker, Paul Kubasek, Andre Ramirez, Cynthia Bruno, K Wilkins, Brianna Frye, Casey McFall, Anni Chung, Sheila Lee, Lauri Walker, Rod Williams, Kerrie Klauber Dan and Rob Freehling*

***Via Conference:***

*Carmen Rudshagen, Carmelita Miller, Tina Nguyen, Wayne Waite and Robin Enkey*

1. **Welcome and Introductions— Robert Castañeda, LIOB Chair and Commissioner Catherine J.K. Sandoval -*Standing Item***

*Chairman Castañeda and Commissioner Sandoval welcomed all present to the Low Income Oversight Board Meeting in San Francisco.*

*Chairman Castañeda thanked the Commission for the action taken on the recent Bridge Funding Decision and also thanked staff at the CPUC for their time and dedication during this process*

**2. Election of LIOB Chair and LIOB Vice-Chair– Facilitated by Robert Castañeda, LIOB Chair - *Action Item***

*Motion to elect a chair and vice chair of the LIOB; Vice-Chairwoman Watts moved the nomination of Chairman Castañeda to continue serving as chair, seconded by Board Member Lopez (Yes: Commissioner Sandoval, Board Members Watts, Lopez, Delgado-Olson, Wimbley, and Rendler; motion passed) . (Members Abstained: Chairman Castañeda)*

*Chairman Castañeda moved the nomination of Board Member Delgado-Olson to serve as the Vice-Chair of the LIOB, seconded by Board Member Lopez (Yes: Commissioner Sandoval, Chairman Castañeda, Board Members Watts, Toledo, Lopez, Delgado-Olson, Wimbley and Rendler; motion passed)*

**3. Public Comments— Facilitated by Robert Castañeda, LIOB Chair - *Informational/Standing item***

*No comments were offered during public comment.*

**4. Approval of the October 29th, 2015 LIOB Meeting Minutes, Facilitated by Robert Castañeda, LIOB Chair - *Action Item***

*Motion to approve the October 29th, 2015 minutes; moved by Board Chairman Castañeda, seconded by Board Member Lopez. (Yes: Commissioner Sandoval, Chairman Castañeda, Board Members Watts, Toledo, Delgado-Olson, Lopez, Wimbley and Rendler; motion passed)*

**5. Announcement of the appointments to the LIOB - Commissioner Catherine J.K. Sandoval - *Informational Item***

* **Board Members Larry Gross, Ortensia Lopez and Patricia Watts**
* **CSD Representative – Jason Wimbley**
* **Water Representative – Jeff Linam**

*Commissioner Sandoval announced that at the February11, 2016 Commission meeting the Commission approved the re-appointments of Board members Larry Gross, Ortensia Lopez, Patricia Watts, Jason Wimbley and also welcomed Mr. Jeff Linam as the new Water Representative for the LIOB.*

**6. SB 350 – Background of SB 350 and Work Plan Development – Melicia Charles - *Informational Item***

*Ms. Melicia Charles provided a high level overview of SB 350. Ms. Charles explained that SB 350 sets a target for 40% economy-wide GHG emissions reduction from 1990 levels by 2030, considering the impacts on disadvantaged communities in the CPUC decision-making process. Commencing in 2017, the CPUC shall adopt a process for each load-serving entity to file an Integrated Resource Plan (IRP) and it also requires the CPUC to make Renewables Portfolio Standard program rule changes. In regards to disadvantaged communities, the California Energy Commission is required to complete a study on the barriers and opportunities for access to renewable energy by low income customers. SB 350 identifies a number of new energy efficiency sources that can count towards the goal and commencing in 2019, it requires the CPUC to report to the Legislature every four years on progress towards maximizing EE saving contributions in disadvantaged communities and it also requires for the CEC to complete a study on barriers and opportunities for access to EE/weatherization by low income customers, as well as study barriers to contracting opportunities for local small businesses in disadvantaged communities. In regards to transportation electrification, SB 350 specifies transportation electrification is necessary to reduce economy wide GHGs and it defines transportation electrification to include vehicles, vessels, trains, boats, & other equipment, transportation electrification efforts will target charging infrastructure availability, underserved communities, new technologies for customers, and vehicle grid-integration. Air Resources Board is required to complete a study on barriers and opportunities for access to clean transportation options in disadvantaged communities. SB 350 calls for the CAISO to consider regional expansion and it would coordinate electricity systems across the West and utilize ISO’s infrastructure to develop one western grid. CAISO must study the impacts of the regional market including the benefits to ratepayers, job creation, environmental impacts and the impacts to disadvantaged communities. CAISO, CEC and CPUC must jointly hold a workshop on any modifications to its structure and results of the studies. As noted, SB 350 adds a statutory focus on disadvantaged communities and in addition to the requirements; the CPUC/CEC must establish an advisory group of representatives from disadvantaged communities to provide advice on clean energy and pollution reduction programs and determine whether they will benefit disadvantaged communities. Ms. Charles reported that in Dec 2015, Energy Division staff held a workshop on SB 350 planning before commissioners and on February 2016, the CPUC adopted a new rulemaking that considers IRP in the current Long Term Procurement Planning process proceeding. CPUC staff is coordinating internally across all relevant proceedings, as well as with ARB/CEC/CAISO on implementing SB 350 and the CPUC has requested new resources to implement SB 350.*

*Chairman Castañeda suggested working with Community Services and Development (CSD) on the barriers study, as CSD has expertise and history of working with disadvantage communities. He also suggested reaching out to members of this Board to join the Disadvantaged Communities Advisory Board.*

*Board Member Wimbley reinforced Chairman Castañeda’s suggestion to reach out to CSD, and mentioned that for the last 2 state fiscal years, CSD was appropriated climate investment funds that carried the same priorities and emphasis on disadvantaged communities.*

*Commissioner Sandoval commented that on the definition of disadvantaged communities, this Board could provide important input. The statue talks about certain attributes in terms of pollution, or other hazards that lead to health effects. CalEnvironScreen is one way to look at disadvantage communities, but it is not the only way. She added that it is important to look at a variety of these attributes and how these overlay with number programs, such as CARE, ESA, LifeLine and LIRA.*

*Ms. Alana Mathews from the California Energy Commission reported that part of the CEC’s plan on SB350 is to focus on low income barriers for low income access to efficiency as well as renewable energy, and contracting opportunities for small business. She mentioned that the CEC is still in the development phase. The CEC has an ambitious goal to hold 10-20 workshops throughout the state and to visit rural areas and look at barriers with weatherization. Ms. Mathews mentioned that their report is due January 1, 2017.*

*Ms. Charles’ full report can be viewed and downloaded at:* [*http://www.liob.org/doc2/Item%206.%20SB%20350%20Overview%20for%20LIOB%2002232016.ppt*](http://www.liob.org/doc2/Item%206.%20SB%20350%20Overview%20for%20LIOB%2002232016.ppt)

**7. Legislative Update – CPUC- Office of Governmental Affairs – *Informational/Standing Item***

*Mr. Michael Minkus from the Office of Governmental Affairs provided a summary of low income related Bills. Mr. Minkus informed the board that all Governors’ Budget change proposal will be published and hosted on the Department of Finance website. The Commission is still reviewing the Bills and has not taken a position on the Bills. OGA will continue to monitor these Bills and will continue to inform the Board on any changes.*

*Mr. Minkus’ Legislative Update report can be viewed and downloaded at:*

[*http://www.liob.org/doc2/Item%207.%20Low%20Income%20Oversight%20Board%20(LIOB)%20related%20bills%202-21-2016.doc*](http://www.liob.org/doc2/Item%207.%20Low%20Income%20Oversight%20Board%20(LIOB)%20related%20bills%202-21-2016.doc)

**8. Water Utilities’ Current Issues – Viet (Kevin) Truong, Utilities Engineer, Division of Water and Audits *Update/Informational/Standing Item***

*Mr. Kevin Truong provided updates on the drought, the drought actions by the CPUC, the low-income discounts in 2015, the low-income discount rulemaking and an update on new water Legislation. He highlighted that California remains in a drought despite El Niño, there has only been three wet days in February, with 1 ½ months left in rainy season. Under the mandatory restrictions, the savings goal will be reached as the*

*IOU’s are doing their share for conservation. The State Water Resource Control Board has extended the water restrictions through October 2016, which will require Californians to save an additional 1.0 MAF (million acre-feet) and the targets in each district will remain the same. On February 11, 2016 the CPUC issued Resolution W-5082, to continue to achieve a reduction in potable urban water use consistent with the restrictions imposed by the State Water Resources Control Board. Also on February 11, 2016 the Commission adopted Resolution W-5078 California Water Service Company and Resolution W-5070 San Gabriel Valley Water Company. Rami Kahlon clarified that the 25% savings goals was set by the Governor in his emergency order, which was implemented by the State Water Resources Control Board and even though the restrictions were extended through 2016 the overall savings goals is still 25%, this issue could potentially be revisited by the State Board in April.*

*Mr. Truong’s presentation can be viewed and downloaded at:* [*http://www.liob.org/doc2/ACF3A.ppt*](http://www.liob.org/doc2/ACF3A.ppt)

**9. Highlights of Upcoming Activities for Low-Income Energy Programs – Energy Division Staff - *Standing Item***

1. **Update on the Low Income Needs Assessment**

*Ms. Lisa Paulo provided an update on the status of the Low Income Needs Assessment. She mentioned that this study was required by D.14-08-030. The study will research questions such as energy burden and insecurity, unique customer needs, beneficial and other energy efficiency measures and income documentation. The objective of the energy burden will be built on the prior study to investigate and employ alternate metrics, to compare low-income customers to moderate-income, and to attempt to include customer payment practices. The unique customer needs will focus on Asian households, undocumented immigrants and workers, CBO’s will be included in performing the survey. For the energy burden customers, a focus group approach will be used, this category will also focus on multi-family tenants. On the beneficial customer measures the study will be looking at the unique customer needs between the different targeted groups. The study will also be looking at the technology status of the households for the low income customers, and find out if the customer is internet ready in order to acquire additional types of measures that require internet access or Wi-Fi, or if the customer is interested in new types of technologies, such as smart thermostats. Lastly, the study will revisit the issues of income requirements and verification for ESA and CARE. The proposed time line is to have a final research plan at the end of February; a draft report in early October and a final report by December 15, 2016.*

*Ms. Paulo informed the Board that Energy Division recently received approval for additional staff to assist with implementing AB2672 and overseeing Order Instituting Rulemaking (R.15-03-010) to identify disadvantaged communities in the San Joaquin Valley and analyze economically feasible options to increase access to affordable energy in those disadvantaged communities. Commissioner Randolph and Administrative Law Judge Tsen are assigned to this proceeding.*

*Ms. Paulo’s full presentations and reports can be viewed and downloaded at:*

[*http://www.liob.org/doc2/Item%209.%20ED%20highlights%20for%20LIOB%2002232016.ppt*](http://www.liob.org/doc2/Item%209.%20ED%20highlights%20for%20LIOB%2002232016.ppt)

[*http://www.liob.org/doc2/Item%209.%20LIOB%20LINA%20Status%20Update%2002232016.ppt*](http://www.liob.org/doc2/Item%209.%20LIOB%20LINA%20Status%20Update%2002232016.ppt)

1. **2016 Public Purpose Audit Program (including CARE) Overview – Carl Danner, Chief Internal Audit Unit - Informational Item**

*Mr. Carl Danner the Chief in the Internal Audit Unit (IAU) provided a brief on the Internal Audit Unit and the efforts that this unit will be making with regards with the Public Purpose Programs, starting this year and beyond. Mr. Danner informed the Board that the IAU reports directly to the Commission, the IAU does not report through the normal management structure of the agency. This is intended to preserve independence for their efforts to audit the Commission’s management and activities. The Commission adopted a Charter that specifies the role, authority and professional standards, the charter can be found at:*

[*http://www.cpuc.ca.gov/uploadedFiles/CPUC\_Public\_Website/Content/About\_Us/History/InternalAuditCharter052115.pdf*](http://www.cpuc.ca.gov/uploadedFiles/CPUC_Public_Website/Content/About_Us/History/InternalAuditCharter052115.pdf)

*Mr. Danner highlighted that the IAU is not in the policy business, the IAU does not regard themselves as auditing Commission policy decisions or policy directions, but their focus is on internal operations and their effectiveness. The IAU is fully-staffed, including Chief, Supervisor, and four working staff. Mr. Danner reported on the General Internal Audit Unit activities, the focus of the Public Purpose fund audits and the audit framework. The Internal Audit Unit is currently authorized to perform PP fund audits in Energy, the CARE and ESA is in process; R&D, Energy Efficiency, and EM&V are pending. On the Telecommunications, CHCF-A, CHCF-B, DDTP is in process –; CA LifeLine is pending and CASF already conducts regular financial and managerial audits , CTF is currently undergoing a proceeding, IAU will postpone. Mr. Danner estimates that the CARE and ESA audit should be completed in approximately 9 months. Mr. Danner’s report can be viewed and downloaded at:*

[*http://www.liob.org/doc2/Item%2010.%20Public%20Purpose%20Audit%20Program%20Overview%2002232016.ppt*](http://www.liob.org/doc2/Item%2010.%20Public%20Purpose%20Audit%20Program%20Overview%2002232016.ppt)

[*http://www.liob.org/doc2/Item%2010.%20Public%20purpose%20program%20audit%20rubric%2002232016.doc*](http://www.liob.org/doc2/Item%2010.%20Public%20purpose%20program%20audit%20rubric%2002232016.doc)

1. **Susan E. Walters, Senior Vice President, California Emerging Technology Fund**

**Follow Up Report: Outreach to Low-Income Households and Collaboration with Energy Utilities as a Green Strategy – Informational Item**

*Ms. Susan Walters provided a follow up report on the outreach to low-income households in collaboration with energy utilities. Ms. Walters informed the Board that by March 31st, 2016 the FFC will vote on its Lifeline proceeding, and it will determine on whether or not to include broadband in the lifeline program. Ms. Walters informed the Board that they are currently conducting a couple of pilots and The California Foundation of Independent Living Center (CFILC) has been the primary partner, along with SMUD and SCE. A new partnership agreement has been signed with SMUD and CFILC, full implementation is in effect from October 2015 – April 2016. To date 47,500 letter have been sent with 15,000 calls to CFLIC, CFILC provides information about the SMUD online portal. SCE-CFILC has also entered a partnership; this pilot will be mailing 10,000 customers with disabilities beginning in April. The letter describes the offer and that CFILC is the partner handling calls; and toll-free number is provided. Progress is being made with other utilities. SMUD continues to reach out to low-income households; SDG&E meeting resulted in decision to take next steps; SCE will be doing a pilot with CFILC; DWP has scheduled meeting in March and PG&E has expressed interested and wants to meet. Ms. Walters mentioned that there are many benefits to the utilities such as transaction costs will decrease for billing and communications; low-income customers will have equal access to emergency notification and information; equal access to products and services that require Internet access; customers can use information from smart meters to manage their usage; customers can pay bills online when cash is available without having to spend time and money to pay bills in person. There are 3 primary barriers to broadband adoption by low-income households: cost, relevance and digital literacy. Effective Digital Inclusion programs must address all 3 barriers to tackle the “wall of poverty”. Ms. Walters added that there are tremendous opportunities through the partnerships or collaborations with the energy utilities, as the energy utilities have programs that focus specifically on low income communities. Ms. Walters mentioned that the LIOB can be a powerful voice and collaborator on partnerships with energy utilities. She suggested for the LIOB to consider endorsing a resolution or strategy and sending a letter of recommendation to the Commission supporting these type of pilots.*

*Commissioner Sandoval commented that the design of this Board is to advice the CPUC and also to advice the Legislature as requested. Commissioner Sandoval will consult with Legal Division about the form of advice the LIOB can provide, as there might be some latitude, and a resolution in the form of advice may be permissible.*

*Ms. Walters’ full presentation can be viewed and downloaded at:*

[**http://www.liob.org/doc2/ACF12.ppt**](http://www.liob.org/doc2/ACF12.ppt)

1. **Investor Owned Utilities Reports – Utility Representatives**

**Standing /Action/Discussion Item**

* + - 1. **CARE Enrollment Penetration and Expenditures**
      2. **ESA Homes Treated and Program Expenditures**
      3. **Projected Year-End Expenditures and Unspent Funds**

*Mr. Mark Aguirre of SoCalGas provided an update on the current enrollment, penetration and expenditures for the CARE and ESA programs. Mr. Aguirre highlighted the 2015 year-end for CARE enrollment, penetration and expenditures. SoCalGas enrolled 1,556,906 out of 1,899,820 eligible customers, with a penetration rate of 81.95%. For 2015 the YTD expenditures is at 74.09% of authorized, with $102,281,402 in discounts. For the ESA program, SoCalGas treated 80,316 homes out of a goal of 136,836 for 58.69% goal, which is 56.06% of the authorized spent.*

*Commissioner Sandoval asked about the spending in 2015, which seems substantially lower than the previous 2 years.*

*Mr. Aguirre explained that the main reason it’s lower, is because of the lower amount of homes treated. SoCalGas is targeting greater multi-families and as a result the average unit cost for multi-family is less, since they don’t do appliances for multi-family, he added that this trend may continue into 2016.*

*Board Member Watts asked if SoCalGas tracks those customers that get enrolled in the program, but don’t finish the weatherization process, and the homes doesn’t get treated, as this could have an impact on the lower percentage of success.*

*Mr. Aguirre mentioned that these numbers are tracked in the monthly and annual reports and that this is something worth looking into. Lastly, Mr. Aguirre provided and update on the 2015 Year-End expenditures and unspent funds.*

*Chairman Castañeda expressed concern about the underspending on ME&O; and he stated that this is a critical issue.*

*Mr. Aguirre mentioned that part of the underspending on ME&O, was that in 2012 they were unclear as to what funding they would get, and they were very conservative, and this was a contributor to the underspending.*

*SoCalGas’ report can be viewed and downloaded at:*

[*http://www.liob.org/doc2/Item%2012.%20SoCalGas%20CARE%20ESA%20Participation%20and%20Expenses%20LIOB%2002232016.ppt*](http://www.liob.org/doc2/Item%2012.%20SoCalGas%20CARE%20ESA%20Participation%20and%20Expenses%20LIOB%2002232016.ppt)

*Ms. Mary O’Drain of PG&E provided an update on the current enrollment, penetration and expenditures for the CARE and ESA programs. Ms. O’Drain noted that the numbers are based on Dec 2015 (Year End) monthly report and final expenditures will be reported in 2015 annual report in May 2016. PG&E enrolled 1,423,989 out of 1,635,673 eligible customers, with a penetration rate of 87%. For 2015 the YTD expenditures is at 89% of authorized, with $558,560,274 in discounts. For the ESA program, PG&E treated 98,646 homes out of a goal of 119,940 for 82% goal, which is 83% of the authorized spent. Ms. O’Drain provided an update on the 2015 Year-End expenditures and unspent funds.*

*PGE’s report can be viewed and downloaded at:*

[*http://www.liob.org/doc2/Item%2012.%20PGE%20CARE%20ESA%20Participation%20and%20Expenses%20LIOB%2002232016.ppt*](http://www.liob.org/doc2/Item%2012.%20PGE%20CARE%20ESA%20Participation%20and%20Expenses%20LIOB%2002232016.ppt)

*Vice-Chairman Delgado-Olson commented that he has been in talks with PG&E and the idea of tying outreach to social welfare systems within Government. He mentioned that PG&E has been very open and creative on how to start a pilot in a few counties. Right now they are trying to bring together the different agencies into one room to brainstorm and figure out what would make sense to make this effective. He thanked PG&E for their willingness to participate and for involvement.*

*Ms. Sheila Lee of SCE provided an update on the current enrollment, penetration and expenditures for the CARE and ESA programs. SCE enrolled 1,281,620 out of 1,499,342 eligible customers, with a penetration rate of 85.5%. For 2015 the YTD expenditures is at 61% of authorized, with $372,593,533 in discounts. For the ESA program, SCE treated 48,573 homes out of a goal of 87,389 for 56% goal, which is 69% of the authorized spent. Ms. Lee noted that SCE enrolled 77, 025 in the program, however, they were unable to treat 28,452 of these customers, primarily due to the 3 measure minimum requirements, and therefore, they could not be classified as treated homes. Ms. Lee provided an update on the 2015 Year-End expenditures and unspent funds; these numbers are not final and may change in their annual reports. SCE’s report can be viewed and downloaded at:*

[*http://www.liob.org/doc2/Item%2012.%20SCE%20CARE%20ESA%20Participation%20and%20Expenses%20LIOB%2002232016.ppt*](http://www.liob.org/doc2/Item%2012.%20SCE%20CARE%20ESA%20Participation%20and%20Expenses%20LIOB%2002232016.ppt)

*Ms. Giovanna Casillas of SDGE provided an update on the current enrollment, penetration and expenditures for the CARE and ESA programs. SDGE enrolled 272,077 out of 370,088 eligible customers, with a penetration rate of 74%. For 2015 the YTD expenditures is at 98% of authorized, with $76,448,948 in discounts. For the ESA program, SDGE treated 12,857 homes out of a goal of 20,316 for 63% goal, which is 73% of the authorized spent. Ms. Casillas provided an update on the 2015 Year-End expenditures and unspent funds. SDGE’s report can be viewed and downloaded at:*

[*http://www.liob.org/doc2/Item%2012.%20SDGE%20CARE%20ESA%20Participation%20and%20Expenses%20LIOB%2002232016.ppt*](http://www.liob.org/doc2/Item%2012.%20SDGE%20CARE%20ESA%20Participation%20and%20Expenses%20LIOB%2002232016.ppt)

*At the request of Commissioner Sandoval PG&E, SDG&E and SCE provided an overview of the en* banc on the Marketing, Education and Outreach, related to the Residential Rate Reform in Proceeding (R.12-06-013). The en banc was held in the CPUC Auditorium February 4, 2015.  A webcast of this event is available at: [*http://www.californiaadmin.com/ca/cpuc/other/20160204/*](http://www.californiaadmin.com/ca/cpuc/other/20160204/) *. Documents presented at the LIOB meeting can be viewed and downloaded at:* [*http://www.liob.org/meetings.aspx*](http://www.liob.org/meetings.aspx)

1. **Lifeline Telephone Program Update – Anna Jew, CPUC -Consumer Programs –Communications Division Informational/Standing Item**
2. **Lifeline Proceeding Update**
3. **Update on Lifeline Direct Application Project**
4. **Tribal Lifeline Update**

*Ms. Anna Jew from the Communications Division provided an update on the program statistics, status of the Phase II proceeding and an update on the Enhanced Lifeline. Ms. Jew highlighted that there are currently 14 approved CA LifeLine wireless providers, 8 pending wireless carriers requesting for CA Lifeline and 3 pending wireless carriers requesting for Federal LifeLine. There are 1,512,692 participants in the CA LifeLine wireless; 639,141 participants in the CA LifeLine wireline and 60 participants in the Federal-only Lifeline wireless. Ms. Jew’s presentation included the current penetration participation rate.*

*On the Phase II Proceeding Ms. Jew reported that D.14-01-036 was issued on January 16, 2014, to modernize and expand the CA LifeLine program, on December 24, 2015, Commissioner Sandoval issued an amended scoping memo and ruling to prioritize many issues. In addition, Commissioner Sandoval also reinstated the service connection/activation and service conversion charges to CA LifeLine wireless through December 2016. The workshop on Phase II issues has not been finalized. On the enhanced Lifeline program, there are currently 118 participants. Ms. Jew informed the Board that she will be talking to the top carriers to discuss their current marketing & outreach strategies and their plans for future outreach strategies.* *The third party administrator is currently working on a methodology to provide notification in real-time to wireless carriers regarding addresses that plot within Federally Recognized Tribal Land areas.*

*Board member Toledo commented that the numbers are still very low, and that the providers are still not aware of the Enhanced LifeLine program.*

*It was mentioned that any interested consumer advocates wishing to be considered to be part of the LifeLine Committee Board, should contact the Communications Division. Ms. Jew will continue to provide the Board with updates on these issues. Ms. Jew’s presentation can be viewed and downloaded at:*

[*http://www.liob.org/meetings.aspx*](http://www.liob.org/meetings.aspx)

1. **Telecommunications Education and Assistance in Multiple-Languages (TEAM) – Ravinder Mangat and Kyle DeVine - Public Advisor’s Office - Informational Item**
2. **Community Help and Awareness of Natural Gas and Electric Services (CHANGES) Program Ravinder Mangat and Kyle DeVine – Public Advisor’s Office - Informational Item**

*Ms. Kyle DeVine from the Public Advisor’s Office provided a report on the TEAM and CHANGES programs. Ms. DeVine explained that the CPUC created two programs to provide education and complaint resolution services for limited English proficient (LEP) consumers. The program also assists seniors and the disabled. The TEAM and CHANGES provide services to LEP consumers, in the language of their choice, through a statewide network of community based organizations (CBOs). The program component consists of outreach, education, complaint resolution. Among many other services, the TEAM program assists LEP clients to help understand the rules to enroll and remain on California LifeLine, also it assists those clients who write in their language’s characters, and do not use the Roman alphabet upon which English is based or do not have the standard signature or initials acceptable for the forms.*

*Ms. DeVine also discussed the predatory sales practices, where the wireless companies hand out free cell phones, but their “Sales Pitch” doesn’t explain that the client’s signature on the English-only receipt, switches them to the company’s service. The TEAM CBO held a workshop to alert the community, resulting in 57 complaints within a week. The CHANGES team has received complaints from customers about the Core Transport Agents (CTAs) that have used abusive sales practices to get people to switch.*

*Public Advisor’s Office has provided a report to CPUC staff. Another issue that the CHANGES program has dealt with is the CARE High Use Treatment; CARE consumers have been confused about the IOUs’ High Use practices for CARE customers. In this case, the contractor rapidly trained CBOs and updated user guides; helping caseworkers to educate and to assist consumers who are subject to the treatment.*

*Ms. DeVine informed the Board that the TEAM and CHANGES programs will be provided by the same contractor to provide consumers with ease of access, and that the provision by the same contractor will result in economies of scale and frugal expenditure of public funds.*

*Commissioner Sandoval thanked Ms. DeVine for her report and for their work on the TEAM and CHANGES programs and wanted to ensure that they coordinate with the LifeLine team and staff.*

*Ms. DeVine’s report can be viewed and downloaded at:*

[*http://www.liob.org/doc2/Item%2014.%20TEAM%20and%20CHANGES%20LIOB%20presentation%2002232016.ppt*](http://www.liob.org/doc2/Item%2014.%20TEAM%20and%20CHANGES%20LIOB%20presentation%2002232016.ppt)

**16. Subcommittee Reports and Updates – Facilitated by Robert Castañeda, LIOB Chair *Standing /Action/Discussion Item***

1. **Marketing & Outreach (Board Members Toledo, Gross, Watts, Delgado-Olson & Rendler)**

*The Marketing & Outreach and the ESAP and CARE Implementation subcommittees held a joint meeting on December 18th, 2015.*

1. **ESAP and CARE Implementation (Board Members Castañeda, Wimbley, Watts, Lopez & Rendler)**

*The Marketing & Outreach and the ESAP and CARE Implementation subcommittees held a joint meeting on December 18th, 2015.*

1. **Workforce Education and Training (Board Members Hernandez & Castañeda)**

*The Workforce Education and Training subcommittee did not meet.*

1. **Water Industry (Board Members Stephenson, Lopez and Castañeda)**

*The Water Industry did not meet. Chairman Castañeda moved the nomination of Board Member Jeff Linam to the Water Industry Subcommittee, seconded by Board Member Toledo (Yes: Commissioner Sandoval, Chairman Castañeda, Board Members Lopez, Delgado-Olson, Wimbley, Toledo, Rendler and Linam; motion passed)*

1. **Emerging Issues/Climate Change (Board Members Toledo & Delgado-Olson)**

*Board Member Delgado-Olson invited Mr. Robert Freehling to come before the Board to discuss various issues on Climate Change. Mr. Freehling’s presentation can be viewed and downloaded at:*

[*http://www.liob.org/doc2/Item%2016.%20Subcommittee%20%20-%20Emerging%20Issues-Climate%20Change.ppt*](http://www.liob.org/doc2/Item%2016.%20Subcommittee%20%20-%20Emerging%20Issues-Climate%20Change.ppt)

1. **AB 327 Subcommittee (Board Members Hernandez, Lopez, & Wimbley)**

The AB 327 Subcommittee did not meet.

**17. Future Meetings Dates & Agenda Items for Future Meeting - Discussion Item**

*Chairman Castañeda asked Board members to review the letter drafted to consider additional resources to the LIOB. Letter can be found at:*

[Item 5e. Chairman Castaneda's Letter re Justification for Resources to the LIOB7-20-16](http://www.liob.org/doc7202016/Item%205e.%20Chairman%20Castaneda%27s%20Letter%20re%20Justification%20for%20Resources%20to%20the%20LIOB7-20-16.pdf)

*Commissioner Sandoval thanked staff for all of their coordination with the LIOB meeting. The next meeting will be in Sacramento. Commissioner Sandoval mentioned that she has started the coordination for the September 22, 2016 meeting with some of the tribes in Eureka and also to visit some of the Tribal areas close by.*

*The Board and staff thanked IT staff for all of the support provided to the LIOB.*

*Meeting adjourned at 4:15pm*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Wednesday, July 20th  2016**  Sacramento City Hall  Historic Building  Hearing Room #204, 2nd Floor  915 I Street  Sacramento, CA | **Thursday, September 22nd, 2016**  Eureka City Hall  Council Chambers  531 “K” Street  Eureka, CA 95501 | **November – Date/Location TBD**  Long Beach, CA |

The archived video webcast of this meeting is accessible at: <http://www.adminmonitor.com/ca/cpuc/other/20160223/>